

STATE OF CALIFORNIA
OFF-HIGHWAY MOTOR VEHICLE RECREATION COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES SYNOPSIS - UNAPPROVED

December 1, 2011

Fairfield Inn & Suites
503 E. Danenberg Drive
El Centro, CA 92243

IN ATTENDANCE:

OHMVR COMMISSIONERS:

Eric Lueder, Chair

Breene Kerr

Kane Silverberg

Paul Slavik

Gary Willard

CALIFORNIA STATE PARKS OHMVR STAFF:

Daphne Greene, Deputy Director, OHMVR Division

Phil Jenkins, Chief, OHMVR Division

Tim La Franchi, Legal Counsel, OHMVR Division

OTHER OHMVR STAFF AND REGISTERED VISITORS

1 **AGENDA ITEM I - CALL TO ORDER**

2 Chair Lueder called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: Welcome, everybody, to the
4 meeting of the California State Parks OHMVR Commission
5 meeting. Happy to be here in El Centro. I want to
6 take a moment to thank Division staff and Ocotillo
7 Wells staff and Heber Dunes staff for the tour
8 yesterday. We had a great time. And it was really
9 nice to see a small park that really serves the
10 community. I think we all enjoyed it and appreciate
11 all of the work that went into putting that together.

12 **AGENDA ITEM I(A) - PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

13 Commissioner Kerr led the meeting attendees in the
14 Pledge of Allegiance.

15 **AGENDA ITEM I(B) - ROLL CALL**

16 Five Commission Members were present at time of roll
17 call. Brad Franklin, Diana Perez, and Stan Van Velsor
18 were absent from the meeting.

19 **AGENDA ITEM II - APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

20 CHAIR LUEDER: Approval of the agenda. Do I
21 hear a motion to approve?

22 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I move to approve the
23 agenda.

24 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: I second.

25 CHAIR LUEDER: All in favor?

1 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

2 CHAIR LUEDER: Motion carries.

3 **AGENDA ITEM III - APPROVAL OF SUMMARY MINUTES**

4 CHAIR LUEDER: Item No. 3, approval of the
5 summary minutes for October 14th, 2011. Do I hear a
6 motion for approval of those minutes?

7 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: I motion we approve.

8 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I second it.

9 CHAIR LUEDER: Any discussion of the minutes
10 before we approve?

11 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Much easier to read.
12 Thank you for that. It's really a pleasure to read
13 them. Figure out what's going on.

14 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: If I may, we did have a
15 couple of questions about also providing on the web the
16 transcribed minutes, so we'll be giving the public both
17 formats of the minutes will be available on the web.

18 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. Commissioner
19 Silverberg, did you have a comment?

20 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: I just wanted to say I
21 really appreciated being able to get through them
22 quickly and get to the point. It's nice.

23 CHAIR LUEDER: No further discussion, all in
24 favor of approval of minutes.

25 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

1 CHAIR LUEDER: Motion carries.

2 **AGENDA ITEM VI - REPORTS - COMMISSIONERS'**

3 CHAIR LUEDER: Are there any Commissioners that
4 have a report? Commissioner Slavik.

5 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I have a couple of reports
6 since Stan isn't here. We had the meeting of the
7 Education Advisory Group, and I think it went very
8 well. We held it at Prairie City at the Environmental
9 Training Center there which was apropos. And we were
10 surrounded by several Ph.D.'s, people that we were
11 using as sources for creating a better education
12 program and more rounded impactful education program
13 for the state. So hopefully we can move forward in
14 that. And maybe I can ask the Deputy Director if there
15 has been anything since that meeting that has been
16 moved.

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Thank you, Commissioners.
18 Welcome to the public. Daphne Greene, Deputy Director
19 of the Commission. We had a productive first meeting.
20 We had a number of the invitees. Some know very little
21 about OHV recreation and others know a great deal. And
22 we're looking at how we're going to be able to
23 implement our goal in the Strategic Plan of having an
24 educated informed community. One of the objectives in
25 our Strategic Plan is to get this group together to

1 provide a statewide education curriculum. What we
2 decided after that meeting is really the need for focus
3 groups. One of the primary discussions at hand was
4 when we're looking at issues of OHV recreation, how do
5 we ensure safety compliance, and what's going on in the
6 state with all of the different land issues.

7 One of many themes that we talked about was the
8 issue of personal freedom and use of public lands, and
9 that really a lot of this has to do with people worried
10 that there are avenues that are taking place now that
11 are infringing on people's freedom. And so the group
12 decided to reach out to the community through focus
13 groups. We've been working with some of those
14 representatives to look at how we might implement these
15 focus groups. That's the discussions that are going on
16 now. It was agreed that we would wait until after the
17 first of the year to get those groups together. I
18 don't think we will have any problem getting
19 individuals to participate in those focus groups to
20 tell us how they feel.

21 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Thank you. I have one
22 additional comment. We often talk about family in the
23 OHV community, and many of you know that one of our
24 family passed away about a month ago. Dave Oakleaf was
25 a member of District 37. He was tragically killed, and

1 I went to his memorial service. It was amazing. His
2 family was OHV, and there's probably 300 or more people
3 in this church that he had attended, and I would say
4 over half of them were wearing club colors, which I had
5 never been to a funeral service where people were
6 wearing their gear. Lots of kids were there. Lots of
7 families were there. And Dave if you don't know was
8 one of the real organizers in District 37. He was very
9 involved and was one of the guys that helped put on the
10 Catalina Grand Prix. So that was a big event that had
11 come back to Southern California after maybe 50 years
12 or something like that of not being there. He was very
13 involved in that. Somebody said he made something like
14 20 trips to Catalina back and forth just working with
15 their city council and people involved there. So he
16 will be greatly missed.

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: On that note, Commissioner
18 Slavik and Chair Lueder wanted this video presented in
19 commemoration of Dave Oakleaf. And just to put it in
20 perspective, when Paul said Dave was tragically killed,
21 Dave was killed when he was shopping at a Wal-Mart
22 store here in Southern California. He was attacked in
23 the sporting goods aisle. Apparently a man unknown to
24 him grabbed a baseball bat and brutally beat him in the
25 aisle. So it is a reminder to the people we love that

1 we may all agree to disagree and have good debate, but
2 at the end of the day, it's really about the people you
3 love and making sure you hold them tight. So this a
4 video that highlights Dave at the Catalina Grand Prix.
5 (Viewed video.)

6 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Dave was a member of our
7 California Roundtable Stakeholders Group and was an
8 advocate certainly on behalf of the OHV community and
9 in particular on issues regarding sound. He will
10 definitely be missed.

11 CHAIR LUEDER: Any other Commissioner reports at
12 this time? Hearing none, we'll move on to the Deputy
13 Director's report. **AGENDA ITEM IV(B) - REPORTS -**
14 **Deputy Director's**

15 CHAIR LUEDER: Do we have any guests that we
16 wanted to introduce?

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Bob Hamm.

18 CHAIR LUEDER: Welcome, Mr. Hamm, thank you for
19 coming.

20 BOB HAMM: Good morning, thank you. I wanted to
21 welcome you here. Actually, I was hopeful that the
22 chairman of the board of supervisors or one of the
23 supervisors would be able to do that, but they're all in
24 San Francisco this week because the California State
25 Association of Counties is meeting. And today Daphne's

1 boss, the one way up there, Governor Brown, is speaking
2 to them, so they all elected to stay there. I,
3 however, returned last night because I know where the
4 important work in state government is done. So I'm
5 here to welcome you to the Imperial Valley.

6 Let me tell you it was an E ticket ride riding
7 home in through Los Angeles when they said we had to
8 circle for 30 minutes because the wind was too strong
9 to land. When they finally give us clearance, they
10 said, they think it's okay. That was great. And then
11 we took a much smaller plane and landed here late last
12 night, so it's been a long time getting here. But,
13 anyhow, welcome to the valley. Sorry for the wind.
14 It's usually a little bit warmer, dryer and more
15 pleasant wind-wise, but, anyway, while you're here, I
16 hope you do enjoy.

17 I left some of these OHV guides to the valley.
18 This is something that we do with our in-lieu money in
19 Imperial County. We support different organizations.
20 In this case this one was produced by a group called
21 United Desert Gateway, which is basically the chambers
22 of commerce from the Imperial Valley and Yuma Valley,
23 who essentially work as a cooperating agency with the
24 BLM. They do a lot in safety, in education, in
25 cleanups and so on, mostly dealing with the dunes. But

1 as this guide will show you there are a lot of
2 recreation facilities here, including Ocotillo Wells
3 and Heber Dunes, that the Division manages, plus the
4 big dunes to the east and West Mesa where we hold a lot
5 of competitive events in two open areas. Last year we
6 had a major league off-road race. We're expecting to
7 have another one in April where upwards of 200 entries
8 in dune buggies, trucks, that sort of thing that are
9 racing.

10 And I did mention the in-lieu monies here. We
11 get a lot. You're in the capital of off-road racing
12 when you're in Imperial County, and you're also in a
13 community that welcomes off-highway vehicle use, which
14 is not the case in a lot of other areas. We do as much
15 as we can to help promote things like the race that's
16 coming out here. Our local chamber of commerce in
17 conjunction with the city and the county are working to
18 facilitate things with the BLM to make sure they get
19 permits. And we provide a lot of grants to local
20 search and rescue. That's useful in off-highway
21 vehicle recreation. Big grant that basically kept
22 afloat the West Shores Community Ambulance, which is a
23 first responder many times at the Ocotillo Wells
24 facility. And we do a lot with environmental clearance
25 for our race routes. We've done archeological surveys

1 and so on. So you're going to be hearing a lot about
2 what happens down here. And we really are glad that
3 you here. I think it was 2002 when you were last here,
4 and it's just good that you're back in the capital of
5 off-highway vehicle recreation in California, so
6 welcome again. Thank you.

7 CHAIR LUEDER: Thank you, Mr. Hamm, we certainly
8 appreciate you coming down from San Francisco.

9 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Bob is the start of the OHV
10 program. Every piece of legislation that has passed
11 having to do with off-highway vehicle recreation in the
12 State of California, Bob has had some measure of
13 influence. But a little bit of background, if you
14 don't mind, for those Commissioners who may not know
15 you.

16 BOB HAMM: I should mention 40 years ago this
17 month, on December 22nd -- they used to have a
18 different legislative schedule back then in 1971 -- on
19 the north steps of the capitol, Governor Reagan,
20 Governor Reagan, signed AB 2394 which established the
21 OHV program. I was there for that and have been with
22 it ever since. So, thank you, Daphne.

23 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And, Bob, I'm not going to
24 let you get away quite yet. You at one point in time
25 worked on behalf of the county. You think of Bob Hamm,

1 you think of Imperial County. Are you still working
2 for the county?

3 BOB HAMM: I'm the Director of Intergovernmental
4 Relations for Imperial County and also involved with a
5 few other off-road vehicle groups. I was one of the
6 founders of CORVA and an active member of Checkers
7 Off-Road, which is kind of an older group that formed
8 out of Checkers MC, the group with age you get a cage.
9 So we let the young kids do it on two wheels, and we do
10 it on four wheels; very, very active racing group.

11 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We will get back, and I
12 know the BLM folks who will be here want to visit
13 Imperial Sand Dunes, but we certainly intend to do
14 that, but also look at some of the challenges we have
15 with the development of renewable energy, something
16 that's extremely important for Imperial County and how
17 do you balance that with OHV recreation. That will be
18 an issue that will come before you in the next year.

19 BOB HAMM: And agriculture, by the way, we're
20 right in the middle of a vise on those projects.

21 CHAIR LUEDER: Thank you. All right. Deputy
22 Director's report.

23 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Thank you, Bob, for your
24 efforts to welcome use.

25 As the Chair said, we had a delightful day

1 yesterday visiting Heber Dunes, one of our eight SVRAs,
2 State Vehicle Recreation Areas. For those of you who
3 attended, we'll take you back from yesterday and for
4 those of you who were not able to attend, we will give
5 you a little brief overview of what you missed.

6 (Viewed video.)

7 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Thank you, everybody, for a
8 wonderful tour of the Ocotillo Wells District. It was
9 great. So thank you very much. (Applause) We
10 certainly will hear more about that later this
11 afternoon.

12 Next up we've got Jason De Wall, Sector
13 Superintendent, Prairie City, and he's here
14 representing the Twin Cities District with a quick
15 update.

16 **AGENDA ITEM VI(B) - DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S - Program Update**

17 OHV STAFF DE WALL: Good morning, Commissioners,
18 I appreciate the opportunity to talk to you about our
19 Visitor Appreciation Day at Twin Cities District. At
20 Prairie City we're really known for our special events.
21 We have promoters who come in and do several different
22 styles of events. What we're going to talk about today
23 just really briefly is the events that our staff hosts
24 at Prairie City and Carnegie.

25 We have decided as part of our outreach program

1 we really want to have visitor appreciation days where
2 our District Superintendent has allowed us to open the
3 parks for the day to the general public. Anybody and
4 everybody is all welcome, and there is no charge for
5 the day. And we really try to highlight our public and
6 private partnerships. We invite in vendors. There is
7 no charge to the vendors to come to either of the
8 parks. And this year was the second annual for Prairie
9 City and the first annual for Carnegie. It's something
10 we intend to keep going. A good example, last year we
11 had about 450 visitors to Prairie City; this year it
12 was about 800. We have raffles that the staff puts on.
13 The vendors donate products, and then we raffle them
14 off at the end of the day. That raffle is free to
15 everybody. We give an opportunity for the different
16 clubs to give demos. And one of the things we
17 highlighted at Prairie City this year was our
18 four-wheel drive area. We're just about complete with
19 the four-wheel drive area. We're complete enough to
20 have a portion of it open, and Carnegie did something
21 very similar. They made some major improvements to the
22 four-wheel drive area, and we did some demos over
23 there.

24 We had about 1500 visitors at Carnegie. Just to
25 give an example of the clubs, Grass Valley 4-Wheel

1 Drive, Cal Association of 4-Wheel Drive, Dirt Diggers,
2 North Motorcycle Clubs had booths there, the Polka
3 Dots, AMA District 36, Cal Sierra ATVs. It was just a
4 big day where we bring everybody in, and we allow them
5 to enjoy the park. About 18 vendors at Prairie City,
6 30 vendors at Carnegie. And it's just something we try
7 to showcase and bring everybody in. And we also really
8 try to hit the long-term sustainability about education
9 including noise. There were volunteers that did free
10 sound testing for anybody that wanted to be tested.
11 And then we did give them some pointers and tips on how
12 they can meet sound requirements, just as examples.

13 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Both of those days were
14 great days. As you remember, at the last Commission
15 meeting we highlighted for you that they were going to
16 occur. I hope at some point next year you can attend
17 one or both of them. I really think it's a great way
18 to reach out to the community, just an extra special
19 thank you. Obviously, they are recreating at the park
20 anyway, but what we found in particular is that people
21 would mill around and enjoy talking with one another
22 and just making those contacts and connections with
23 everybody. It really was two very special days. Thank
24 you, Jason, appreciate it very much.

25 Also Kathy Dolinar, District Superintendent

1 Ocotillo Wells, will give an update on what's going on
2 at Ocotillo Wells, and you should have some materials
3 in front you.

4 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: Good morning,
5 Commissioners, Kathy Dolinar from Ocotillo Wells.

6 COMMISSIONER KERR: The guy from Carnegie, I
7 just wanted to be able to talk to him maybe after she's
8 done.

9 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Jason, come on back up.

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: Sounds like these events --
11 How does the attendance of the events compare to
12 a regular weekend day?

13 OHV STAFF DE WALL: It differs greatly. We have
14 these events in October. You're talking numbers?

15 COMMISSIONER KERR: Is it twice as many people?

16 OHV STAFF DE WALL: I would say at least twice
17 as many people. The other advantage is we get people
18 who may not be OHV enthusiasts. Some of our
19 concessions will open the doors and do allow free demos
20 for their tracks and things like that where you can go
21 ride the track for free and maybe they'll have --

22 COMMISSIONER KERR: Okay. And we're going to
23 try to move things along today. So you --

24 Do you know who these people are? Now that you
25 know they came to these events, what do you do to -- do

1 you have a voluntary registration program where they
2 get on a mailing list or e-mail list?

3 OHV STAFF DE WALL: We do allow people to sign
4 in. We don't do any hard sales and shoot out spam
5 e-mails or anything like that.

6 COMMISSIONER KERR: So you have sign-in sheets?

7 OHV STAFF DE WALL: Yes, we allow people to sign
8 in if they want more information.

9 COMMISSIONER KERR: Where is that database?

10 OHV STAFF DE WALL: At Prairie City at least,
11 our interpreter keeps the data.

12 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: At Carnegie as they came
13 into the park this year, what we talked about earlier,
14 we asked for their e-mail addresses. That's kept
15 within the park, as well.

16 COMMISSIONER KERR: So is there a statewide
17 consolidation of these databases?

18 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: That's done through the
19 OHV Division. So we hold on to those names. And when
20 we do the e-mail blast, for instance, you get that --

21 COMMISSIONER KERR: So next year all of these
22 people are going to hear about your next event?

23 OHV STAFF DE WALL: Correct, correct. That will
24 be a part of letting everybody know it's coming. Part
25 of the press release.

1 COMMISSIONER KERR: And then is that new -- the
2 area -- I'm sorry, I don't get to the Carnegie as much.
3 But didn't you have some area, some new part of the
4 park you were going to open up?

5 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: At Carnegie what we did
6 this year is we opened up the new four-by-four area,
7 and we opened up the new trials area. If you're
8 talking about the new property, the new old property,
9 we're beginning that general plan process, as well. So
10 hopefully in 18 months, two years' time, you'll have a
11 Carnegie general plan in front of you for approval.

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: So we have to wait for
13 two years for the plan. And then after that plan is
14 approved, then it opens up?

15 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I have one question for
16 Jason. Prairie City, Legislative Day, do we have a
17 rotating legislative day or annual thing going on to
18 invite people from Sacramento there?

19 OHV STAFF DE WALL: The answer is no, not
20 rotating, no. But we do frequently have people from
21 Sacramento come up.

22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: As many of you know, Dave
23 Pickett, AMA 36, invites numerous members of the
24 Legislature to attend the Hangtown event. And I can
25 tell you so we have a large showing at Hangtown. But

1 the Division needs to do a better job of getting people
2 out to the park throughout the year. We should look at
3 getting them out to the Environmental Training Center.

4 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Something on the calendar
5 so that they know that it's there and they're invited.
6 I'm sure there are a lot of staffers that would like to
7 come with their families. That's the way to the heart
8 of the Legislature.

9 OHV STAFF DE WALL: That's a good idea,
10 legislative day.

11 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: Just to give a brief
12 update for Ocotillo Wells. We have a brand-new first-
13 time-ever annual visitor guide that you have been left
14 a copy of. Also, our Off-Highway Adventure Tour Series
15 this year will be offering 20 different off-highway
16 tours, and our annual Roughneck Rendezvous coming up
17 the end of January. I would like to encourage all of
18 you to attend. During that time we could also take a
19 tour of our newest four-by-four area that has been a
20 huge hit on the north end of the park. It's giving
21 people a place to come test their skills from beginning
22 through advance level. Commissioner Lueder had the
23 honor of being one of the first to drive through, and
24 there was a huge smile on his face. We have a new
25 obstacle that was just conquered last week for the

1 first time, so it does offer a lot of challenges.

2 Last weekend, as well as Halloween weekend,
3 started off our season, very busy, very few accidents.
4 Part of that we attribute to the fact that we've now
5 been able to have our trail team and our equipment
6 operators do a lot of work in terms of grooming and
7 realigning some of the trails, signing the trails,
8 giving people just excellent facilities to work in and
9 ride on.

10 We have recently recycled some restrooms that
11 were not able to be used at another park, and we will
12 have nine new CXTs in the restroom in the park by the
13 first of the year. The one at Pumpkin Patch, for those
14 of you had been there, it had no less than six people
15 in line at a time last weekend. And the interpreters
16 stocked it four different times with seven additional
17 rolls of toilet paper. So I'm wondering from the sky
18 where that all would have gone before we had a
19 restroom, but people are absolutely loving the new
20 restrooms.

21 In terms of database, Commissioner Kerr, we do
22 have a database of everybody who has attended our
23 interpreted programs who's interested in them. And
24 series like these go out. Last week it went out to
25 1,437 people, I believe. So they get the information

1 on a regular basis. But I do want to encourage you to
2 come visit the park. I would say that of my time
3 there, Ocotillo Wells is now at its best, which is real
4 exciting for me to be able to have brought it from a
5 place that really had no restrooms, no facilities, no
6 groomed trails. And at the same time it's a big
7 challenge I face because like all State Parks, we're
8 looking at reduced funding and you don't give people a
9 restroom and have them use it and then not have toilet
10 paper in there. So thank you for your time.

11 CHAIR LUEDER: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: Can I ask you a couple of
13 questions, please? Do you have a nonprofit down there
14 that you work with?

15 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: Yes, we do, the Friends of
16 Ocotillo Wells.

17 COMMISSIONER KERR: What kind of activities do
18 they do?

19 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: The Friends of Ocotillo
20 Wells funds a lot of the things that we use for our
21 interpretive programs like at our stargazing we have
22 hot chocolate. They're really a small association at
23 this time. They sell items in the Visitor Center.
24 They sell books, maps about the area. They've been
25 able to fund the annual desert cleanup. And during the

1 Roughneck Rendezvous, they fund the food that's given
2 to the public during that.

3 COMMISSIONER KERR: So they don't organize any
4 big events?

5 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: No, they do not organize
6 events. We partner with a lot of the off-road
7 communities, the San Diego Off-Road Coalition, we
8 partner on their annual Lost Lizard Run, our
9 association works in partnership with them on that, and
10 they share the funds that are raised during that ride.

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: So what's a project that you
12 can't do because of budget considerations that -- you
13 know, a definable project that you wish you could do?

14 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: First on the list? We
15 built a large four-by-four area for the jeeps and the
16 rock crawlers, and I have a lot of people from the
17 motorcycle community who would like us to now put in a
18 course for the motorcycles. So we're looking at a way
19 to do that. A lot of your educational projects we've
20 been looking at getting funded through other
21 organizations. We're working with the county. We're
22 working with like the local trash company, so kind of
23 odd places that we haven't looked before, we're looking
24 to help fund some items.

25 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Kathy, are you talking

1 like an endurocross course?

2 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: Yes, people have been
3 bringing that up that we built one for one group, now
4 we need to build one for the next group. And we
5 certainly have a need for it there, and we would love
6 to do it.

7 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Trials or endurocross?

8 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: I was going to say we've
9 had request for every type.

10 CHIEF JENKINS: Next I'm going to give you just
11 a brief update. You may have heard about the shooting
12 incident at Hungry Valley that happened on the 21st of
13 the month. It's not a whole lot that I can tell you
14 because it's still an open case and there's prosecution
15 pending, et cetera. The L.A. Sheriff's Department has
16 taken the lead on the investigation, which is normal
17 for these sorts of events. Essentially any time one of
18 our officers gets into a shooting, our department
19 policy is that we have an outside agency investigate
20 the incident to make sure there is no appearance that
21 we're trying to protect our own officers, and plus just
22 the fact that we don't do that very often. And so
23 going to somebody like LASO allows us to have folks
24 investigating with a lot more regular experience with
25 this sort of incident.

1 Basically I can give you the broad picture of
2 what happened. In Hungry Valley not too far from the
3 district office is the employee housing here. So on
4 Monday morning, a vehicle drove into the area where
5 there are two houses fairly isolated. A couple of
6 people got out, a man and a woman, and started poking
7 around trying to break into the houses, got into the
8 garage, did some stuff. There was somebody in the
9 other house next to the one that they were poking
10 around in that called the rangers to come out and
11 investigate. Two rangers came out to investigate.
12 First ranger showed up in a vehicle and started to talk
13 to the folks, ran the vehicle and it turned out to be a
14 stolen vehicle. So another ranger came to back the
15 first ranger up. They ended up taking the two people
16 into custody; had the female suspect in a vehicle in
17 custody. A tussle ensued with the male suspect, and he
18 was able to overpower the ranger and actually steal the
19 patrol car with the suspect in the back. So a chase
20 ensued out on the freeway. Before they headed out to
21 the park, he actually turned the vehicle around and
22 tried to assault the officers with the vehicle, tried
23 to run over the officers. That's when the shooting
24 occurred, and the male suspect was injured in that
25 shooting. They went out on the freeway system. They

1 were in about a 30-minute pursuit down the freeway. A
2 lot of noninvolved vehicles were damaged during the
3 pursuit; got off on the surface street. CHP took over
4 the pursuit once out on the freeway. The guy was
5 finally captured and taken into custody.

6 Like I said, LASO did the investigation. The DA
7 there in L.A. County has filed attempted homicide
8 against a peace officer on the suspect, and it's one of
9 those cases that's probably going to go on for years
10 before we can know the outcome. These things tend to
11 have quite a lifetime in lawsuits, and really no
12 details other than that really sketchy outline of what
13 happened can be discussed at all until after that
14 trial. So if you have questions, I would try to answer
15 them, but I probably can't answer much.

16 As soon as the incident began, I went down to
17 the park, was there that afternoon as they were
18 interviewing the suspects and whatnot. State Parks
19 assigned a couple of teams to do our own investigation.
20 So we go out and investigate. Aside from the criminal
21 investigation that's done, any time there is a
22 shooting, we go out and do an administrative
23 investigation. So we're going through all of that
24 process. And the operations side of the Department has
25 been very helpful because they're a lot bigger, have a

1 lot more officers, so we're using all parts of the
2 Department right now to try to make sure that the
3 families of the officers that were involved are taken
4 care of, just all of the nuts and bolts are taken care
5 of. So the two officers that were making the original
6 stop, by the way, came through fine with no injuries.
7 So that was the main thing.

8 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: The news was reporting
9 that the suspect called 911. Can you relate that a
10 little bit?

11 CHIEF JENKINS: So he had been injured in the
12 shooting, so as they were in the pursuit, essentially
13 the reason the pursuit ended is he was getting weak
14 from loss of blood. He had called 911 and asked for
15 help, which must have been an odd 911 call.

16 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: I have to say as only our
17 society can do nowadays, it doesn't take long before
18 all of the blogs, jokes are going, and somebody said,
19 well, if he used his cellphone, was it hands free? Oh,
20 stop everybody. But it really was one of those ones
21 where, again, you give thanks to the training that we
22 give and the investment that we make in our rangers and
23 lifeguards. And in a situation like this, which could
24 have turned out to be really, really bad, particularly
25 in one of the homes there was a young child and an

1 elderly man, we're just very proud of our officers and
2 the job that they did, so.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: While I'm thinking of it, I just
4 wanted to mention to those in attendance that if you'd
5 like to make a comment at the end of the Deputy
6 Director's report, we will have a public comment
7 period. There's cards in the back. So the green ones
8 are for agenda items and the blue ones are for
9 non-agenda items. And at 11 o'clock we'll have an open
10 public comment period on anything that's not on the
11 agenda. Those would be the blue cards. So you fill
12 those out and bring them up to the front table here to
13 the ladies, and we will put them in the public comment
14 period.

15 COMMISSIONER KERR: Had a couple of questions
16 about Hungry Valley. So since you mentioned it, the
17 incident aside, that's a very nice, well-situated
18 facility. How many people are typically there over the
19 course of a year? How does it compare to Hollister or
20 Carnegie?

21 CHIEF JENKINS: The participation there is a
22 little over about 250,000 people per year that come
23 into the park. Largely, the summer season is the slow
24 season like many places in Southern California.

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: Like spring break.

1 And then it's got a lot of possibilities and
2 it's got a high attendance, but its facilities are not
3 quite as well developed as Hollister, or something like
4 that, would that be a correct characterization?

5 CHIEF JENKINS: It doesn't have as many tracks
6 as Hollister. We do have the Quail Canyon track which
7 had been a concession operation for many years.

8 COMMISSIONER KERR: Right, up on the side of the
9 hill there.

10 CHIEF JENKINS: So the park has taken over
11 operation of that. We had various issues with
12 concessionaires, so we now run that ourselves. And
13 it's a well-used facility. They still have a lot of
14 special events. There some nice races that happen
15 throughout the year that are done with various clubs
16 that come in and run the events.

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We also have a newly-opened
18 ATV track there at Hungry Valley, as well. There is
19 also a youth track for ATVs, motorcycles, and also a
20 four-by-four area. There is at Quail Canyon the
21 Ed Waldheim Activity Center. We do those special
22 events at the Roger De Costa Track --

23 COMMISSIONER KERR: How are we doing on the
24 route over to the Forest Service property?

25 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We are progressing on the

1 land exchange with the Forest Service. So we're
2 working on trying to do that. As always, there are
3 challenges, but we've got people working on the project
4 now. So it's there, I promise you, Mr. Waldheim --

5 COMMISSIONER KERR: Didn't we -- the last time
6 we said it's been 20 years?

7 ED WALDHEIM: Since 1977.

8 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: So it has been longer than
9 that.

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: Are we picking up the pace
11 on that?

12 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We've been meeting with the
13 Forest Service. We've gotten further along than we
14 ever have in those 20 years. So it's the closest that
15 we've gotten. Part of that, as I think we indicated
16 last time, when you do a land exchange, it has to be
17 within 25 percent of value of the exchange; otherwise,
18 the Forest Service cannot work with that exchange. So
19 as you're looking at land, that's always the
20 challenges. So that's part of what we're doing.

21 CHIEF JENKINS: And part of that is having a
22 very motivated superintendent, and District
23 Superintendent Jeff Gaffney out there, it's sort of his
24 personal mission in life to get that trail
25 accomplished.

1 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: And let me just say I've
2 recreated out there for a long time, and it's a totally
3 unique situation being close to L.A., being adjacent to
4 federal land. There's really nothing like it in
5 Southern California.

6 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: I think one of the --

7 COMMISSIONER KERR: I think that's why it ought
8 to be a high priority for the agency and Commission to
9 continue to expand and improve this facility.

10 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Absolutely. One of the
11 challenges, quite frankly -- and I'm sorry the Forest
12 Service is not here today -- they might be able to
13 address it. One of the items that we're looking at,
14 which is now a little bit problematic, is the
15 Los Padres. So in the Los Padres, unfortunately fires
16 occur in that area, so oftentimes the area will be
17 closed in summer month. It has closed now for the
18 winter season because of conditions out there. So
19 we're working with the Forest Service to see if there
20 are ways that we can help, whether or not it would be
21 our trail team in partnership with the Forest Service,
22 so we can ensure that the trails are well kept and be
23 able to have more use available on the forest because
24 there is such great connectivity that we have between
25 Hungry Valley and the forest.

1 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay.

2 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: If I may, with the
3 Commission's permission, go right to the LE report. We
4 can come back to legislation, but we'll turn to Brian
5 Robertson.

6 **AGENDA ITEM VI(B)(3) DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S - Public Safety**

7 OHV SUPT. ROBERTSON: Good morning,
8 Commissioners, I'm Brian Robertson, Public Safety
9 Superintendent, with the Division. I'm going to try to
10 keep it short today. We have a lot on the agenda.
11 Just a couple of updates, and then I will be turning it
12 over to Jared Zucker, who is going to talk about the
13 ROHVA Pilot Program.

14 First update, this coming January 25th and 26th
15 we will be conducting the law enforcement OHV training
16 that we spoke about before, and we will also the next
17 day be doing the law enforcement sound monitoring
18 program training. We're going to have eight agencies
19 locally from the Clear Lake area. Three of those
20 agencies are new law enforcement grant recipients.
21 They're all excited about kind of learning our
22 philosophy of how to manage an OHV area and at the same
23 time learn how to monitor the sound monitoring.

24 Also during that time we're going to have a lot
25 of vehicles out to show where we should properly place

1 stickers. We will be spending the two days there
2 overnight, so the whole time we're going to be talking
3 about OHV and sound, just to kind of give them a broad
4 overview of how the Division and OHV use works.

5 Relating to the sound testing or sound
6 monitoring, the last time we spoke there was an issue
7 about the Eldorado National Forest not being able to
8 attend training. I looked into that. Based on a new
9 contract that we were trying to get finished and get
10 scheduling, there was a lapse in time. I did contact
11 them. I offered them to attend this next training,
12 which is in January 25th, 26th or they could continue
13 to go where they normally go in April to Prairie City.
14 They went ahead and decided to take the Prairie City
15 training opportunity, so we've got that worked out.
16 That was brought up last time.

17 At this point I'd like to go ahead and introduce
18 Jared Zucker. Jared is going to talk about the new
19 ROHVA pilot program. It's really exciting. He'll have
20 a nice presentation for you.

21 **AGENDA ITEM VI(B)(3)(A) - DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S - ROHVA**

22 OHV STAFF ZUCKER: Good morning, Commissioners,
23 I'm Jared Zucker, Parks and Recreation specialist at
24 Division Headquarters, and I help coordinate some of
25 the public, as well as SVRA, and Division off-highway

1 vehicle training. Today I'm going to give you just a
2 brief presentation. It's an exciting opportunity for
3 us to engage with ROHVA, which is the Recreational
4 Off-Highway Vehicle Association. They piloted a public
5 training program out of Prairie City SVRA in October.

6 First, I'm going to give you guys a little bit
7 of a brief background on recreation off-highway vehicle
8 popularity. ROVs, also known as side-by-sides or UTVs,
9 they're growing in popularity as opposed to a lot of
10 the other OHV industries that have kind of seen either
11 a flat market or a decline based on the current
12 economic state of the country. So based on the market
13 trends in the OHV industry, ROVs back last year grew
14 15 percent, which is pretty significant.

15 So you might scratch your head and wonder why
16 are ROVs so popular. And you can speculate, yeah,
17 they're cool, they're new, they're fast, they've got a
18 lot of performance aspects, but also if you look at how
19 they're operated, they're very similar to automobiles.
20 You've got hand controls, foot controls, four wheels,
21 and they handle similarly to a car, but there is a
22 perception of that familiarity that is attractive. Not
23 only that, but the benefit that ROVs offer as opposed
24 to ATVs or dirt bikes, they have a lot of utility
25 function. One of those as you can see down in the

1 lower picture is as used for hunting; another, just
2 taking the family out and recreating on public lands.
3 Additionally, you also see them in the fields for
4 agricultural use and whatnot.

5 And then also State Parks staff and other
6 agencies have increased their use in ROVs because they
7 are cost effective. They're a smaller package. You
8 can get equipment and personnel to a location and work
9 rather efficiently. So the benefits, when you look at
10 that and the family that's perhaps on a budget and
11 looking to get into the off-highway vehicle recreation,
12 and they're thinking, well, I can buy four or five
13 ATVs, I can buy a dirt bike or I can buy a ROV that
14 will accommodate my family, haul my gear out to
15 recreate. I can use it on the farm. I can use it to
16 go gather firewood. There is the utility aspect that I
17 think is really attractive to the public.

18 So moving on to kind of the Off-Highway Vehicle
19 Division's responsibility, this is a great opportunity.
20 We've got this activity that's super popular, but there
21 also needs to be some kind of training to keep people
22 safe and responsible on public lands. And part of that
23 is the California Vehicle Code which mandates that the
24 Off-Highway Vehicle Division adopt specific off-highway
25 vehicle training. And we also have the department

1 administrative manual for State Parks which requires
2 that State Parks staff who are operating these
3 vehicles, any self-propelled mobile device such as an
4 ROV, then receive the proper training to be certified.

5 COMMISSIONER KERR: So you have to wear a
6 helmet? We were out this morning, and some guy didn't
7 have a helmet on so we had to go chat with him. When
8 we were driving these things, does it require helmets?

9 OHV STAFF ZUCKER: I don't believe there is a
10 law, per se, that you have to have a helmet on. Of
11 course, it's a smart idea, and I would --

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: There was something this
13 morning at the park where a guy was riding an ATV, and
14 I guess they have to have helmets on.

15 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Riders on ATVs have to have
16 a helmet. Dirt bikes don't have to have a helmet. On
17 road they do, but not off-highway they don't.

18 COMMISSIONER KERR: So do people turn these
19 things over all the time? Because that's the first
20 thing that happens when you buy them, right, you roll
21 them.

22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Hopefully not.

23 COMMISSIONER KERR: A gal who works for me, her
24 husband rolled his like the second day or something.

25 OHV STAFF ZUCKER: That can be the perception

1 that they are such a familiar thing. Looking at an
2 automobile, there's that transition over to an ROV, and
3 they get it on a surface like pavement -- those tires
4 and wheels are specifically designed to be off-highway,
5 and then they do something that they might do in a car,
6 and then maybe it does turn over. So that's where that
7 safety, that safe and responsible training program --

8 COMMISSIONER KERR: Can someone underage drive
9 them in our parks?

10 CHIEF JENKINS: There's no licensing requirement
11 for vehicles inside the --

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: Do you require these kids to
13 get trained before you drive them around?

14 CHIEF JENKINS: The only training that's
15 required right now for the ATVs. So all the --

16 COMMISSIONER KERR: Isn't this more dangerous
17 for a kid to be driving around like at Pismo Beach or
18 something?

19 CHIEF JENKINS: I wouldn't say so. This is the
20 way it developed out. Off-highway vehicles when you're
21 driving off-highway never required licensing. Back
22 during that era when the three-wheel ATVs were so
23 popular, and those really were unstable, there got to
24 be so many accidents that legislation was passed, and
25 that's why you have to have helmet ATVs, you don't have

1 to have it for motorcycles because the legislation was
2 very specific about the ATV problem at the time.

3 What we're seeing with ROV phenomenon as they're
4 becoming more and more popular, we're starting to see
5 more accidents. What we're trying to do in the
6 Division and what the industry is trying to do is
7 address that with safety programs that people can take
8 voluntarily. At some point if it gets to the point
9 that it did with the three-wheel ATVs, then maybe
10 legislation would be initiated, and you might end up in
11 that spot where it's legally required. We haven't
12 reached that point yet as a society. So right now you
13 can go out there and operate it without any sort of
14 official training, et cetera.

15 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: So while the Legislature
16 has yet to make a determination, we are going to
17 embrace this industry that's growing and make sure that
18 we are offering training for our employees, but
19 reaching out as the industry -- and I'm sorry that
20 Commissioner Brad Franklin isn't here today, and
21 actually he sends his regards from a very snowy
22 Pennsylvania where he has work obligations. But the
23 manufacturers have been very aggressive, and ROHVA and
24 the industry has come together and the manufacturers of
25 the products and have come together and have a set of

1 evaluation, essentially criteria saying that you should
2 have a helmet, you should do all of these things. And
3 so now it's going to provide the training. So those
4 are the proactive measures that they're taking.

5 OHV STAFF ZUCKER: And we really are trying to
6 be proactive. We've already partnered. Our current
7 training partners include the ATV Safety Institute, the
8 Motorcycle Safety Foundation, and we utilize both of
9 their curricula to actually facilitate staff training
10 as well as public training. So the way they do that is
11 really through four mechanics. You've got ASI and MSF;
12 they have their own public training formats. Then you
13 also have various SVRAS that offer a drop-in program
14 where public can come and take a safety training
15 program. You also have our staff training, just
16 internal staff service type stuff, and then we also
17 have the Off-Highway Pal Program.

18 This new opportunity with ROHVA, again being
19 proactive and working with our partners, they're really
20 a mirror organization to ASI and MSF, and I work with
21 Tom Yager, the vice-president of ROHVA throughout all
22 three of those training partners. So when you look at
23 ROHVA, they've been around since 2007. They're a
24 national industry organization who promotes safe and
25 responsible ROV use. And they're actually accredited

1 by the American National Standards Institute. And when
2 ROHVA developed standards for design configuration
3 performance of these vehicles, ANSI adopted those. So
4 they're really the forefront in providing ROV safety
5 training program.

6 And in March of last year, they came out with an
7 E course, and that's for the public. It's free, and
8 you can log on and take this series of modules to teach
9 safe and responsible ROV operation. And in the last
10 year, they've come up with a hands-on training
11 component. It's kind of like the secondary approach to
12 this training program to augment that E course, which
13 will be a prerequisite. So that hands-on course
14 features three training formats, just like the ASI
15 course as well as the MSF. You've got the driver coach
16 trainer prep, which teaches the chiefs how to oversee
17 basically the instructor effort. You've got the driver
18 coach course, and that trains the instructors who then
19 facilitate the driver course. And the driver course
20 was basically ROHVA's flagship. That's the one that's
21 going to be offered to the public. That's the one that
22 most of our staff is going to be utilizing.

23 So moving on to what we did at Prairie City
24 SVRA, Tom Yager contacted me and said, hey, we've got
25 this great hands-on training program, we want to debut

1 it and pilot it out at Prairie City. We think it's
2 going to be a fantastic facility that will meet our
3 needs. I, of course, want to encourage that
4 partnership. We want to be on the forefront of this
5 training effort.

6 And in October, got the ball rolling,
7 coordinated with actually Jason from Prairie City to
8 get this training coordinated. In October 21st to the
9 28th, they held this training course, all three levels
10 of it, and 12 folks from all over North America came
11 out to participate in the chief course -- that's the
12 driver coach trainer prep. And they had 12 people from
13 North America complete that. And then we had the
14 driver coach course, and we had six folks from North
15 America complete that, which included two from our
16 SVRAs, one from Prairie City and Oceano Dunes. And
17 then we had six complete the driver course, and they
18 just received their basic operator card. And those six
19 people were comprised of Division staff, as well as
20 Prairie City SVRA staff.

21 So it was a great representation from the
22 Off-Highway Vehicle Division both in providing the
23 facility and also providing students to pilot this
24 training course. And what ROHVA found is that Prairie
25 City more than meets their expectation in facilitating

1 this type of course. The new four-by-four obstacle
2 course out there provided a great opportunity with the
3 scenarios and just a very unique, new environment that
4 the ATV course and also the dirt bike course don't
5 really utilize, so that was pretty exciting. Also it
6 provided a format so they could improve the curriculum
7 and also how they facilitated that course. So it's
8 really exciting to get the ball rolling and get this
9 program launched and hopefully they're going to debut
10 the public course first part of next year.

11 So looking ahead, I would hope to start
12 identifying what training facilities we have at SVRAs
13 so we can start facilitating the ROV course once it's
14 debuted, and also get at least one driver coach trained
15 for each SVRA as well so they can facilitate staff
16 training to meet the requirements in the department
17 administrative manual, and also do the public training
18 to satisfy the California Vehicle Code.

19 And then the next two to three years, I would
20 hope to have a driver coach trainer, one represented
21 regionally in the north and one in the south so that we
22 can do the driver coach courses on a regular basis as
23 needed.

24 So I think with the successful partnering with
25 ASI and MSF, ROHVA is going to also be a successful

1 partner and really looking forward to working with
2 them. And at this time I'd like to turn it over to you
3 guys for any questions.

4 CHIEF JENKINS: Actually, just one
5 clarification. You asked them earlier about the ATV
6 training versus the ROHVA training, one of the things
7 that the public doesn't always understand, so we're
8 always explaining to them, because they're both
9 four-wheel vehicles, so a lot of folks are like, well,
10 if you have to have it for the ATV, why don't you have
11 to have it for the ROV, it looks like a very similar
12 vehicle?

13 The law that requires the ATV training before
14 you can operate it under a certain age and all of that
15 defines the ATV is that you sit astride. In other
16 words, you've got a seat that you sit astride and
17 you've got handlebars. On ROVs you're on a bench seat
18 and --

19 COMMISSIONER KERR: How many of these things are
20 there in California?

21 CHIEF JENKINS: Raw numbers, I don't have off of
22 the top of my head, but it is --

23 COMMISSIONER KERR: We're going to have to
24 facilitate this, build tracks for these people. Are
25 they paying the same green sticker as a dirt bike?

1 CHIEF JENKINS: Yes, they are.

2 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Are they allowed
3 currently in all SVRAs?

4 COMMISSIONER KERR: They can't go on the single
5 tracks at Hollister, right? You're not going to let
6 them on there, are you?

7 CHIEF JENKINS: No. At Hollister Hills you can
8 take them on the Upper Ranch. There are some trails,
9 some paths on the Lower Ranch where you can take a
10 side-by-side. The bulk of the trail is on the Lower
11 Ranch or single track and not --

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: What about that area you
13 opened a couple of years ago?

14 CHIEF JENKINS: We do have a trail in the new
15 area specifically designed for these types of vehicles.
16 So we have both single track and we a trail big enough
17 for side-by-side.

18 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: For land managers it's a
19 challenge because you have single tracks and then you
20 have 50-inches wide with the ATV, how do you keep up
21 with new technology. So when we saw, as Jared said,
22 the 15-percent increase, I think in the past three
23 years when they first came out, we saw 273-percent
24 increase over a three-year period. So the demand
25 particularly as people are aging, they don't

1 necessarily want to sit astride or they want to sit
2 next to somebody to go out and recreate. So there is a
3 huge demand.

4 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: I have a question. I
5 thought these vehicles were basically slower
6 utilitarian-type vehicles, but it sounds like they
7 morphed into something else. Give me just sort of an
8 idea of what types of activities that one would use one
9 of the more high-performance types. Is this climbing
10 sand dunes, blasting down a forest trail?

11 OHV STAFF ZUCKER: You'll see them on the sand
12 dunes, also see them crawling rocks. They really can
13 serve a multitude of recreational opportunities.

14 CHIEF JENKINS: We have seen a few of them up on
15 the Rubicon Trail. And there's also several beta races
16 that go on right now where we'll see them fully fitted
17 out with all of the racks and gears, and it looks like
18 World War II --

19 COMMISSIONER KERR: I think they're great, but I
20 do wonder at some point whether there might be some
21 conflicts between what traditionally has been kind of a
22 two-wheel section of the park, say Hollister, and ATVs
23 are tolerated, but then you start putting mini jeeps
24 out on those trails, which is what these are -- in some
25 countries I'm sure people are driving them on the roads

1 in most parts of the world.

2 CHIEF JENKINS: Right. That's why primarily
3 they would be on the Upper Ranch. On that new section
4 you were asking about on the Lower Ranch, we do have
5 the one trail that goes through there. It's very well
6 marked that it is for the large --

7 COMMISSIONER KERR: Do you have signs that
8 restricts these ROVs?

9 CHIEF JENKINS: Yes, so in that whole new
10 section the Renz property, the single track trails are
11 very clearly marked that these vehicles can't go on it.
12 So we tried to share the terrain so everybody has a
13 place to go, but there is a clear designation in the
14 signage and everything else but which vehicles go into
15 which area on that section.

16 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I know that the challenge
17 in the industry is that it's really a different vehicle
18 even though it looks like an ATV and it kind of acts
19 like an ATV, but the center of gravity is so high that
20 it flips, like you said. I know several people that
21 have got hurt on them already because they think
22 they're interactive, and they're not. They're a larger
23 vehicle, and in my neighborhood people are licensing
24 them. That's another challenge.

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: How do you do that?

1 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: They put license plates on
2 dirt bikes. Americans will figure out a way around
3 anything.

4 CHIEF JENKINS: In some states they're actually
5 licensing these vehicles. And please correct me, I
6 want to set the record straight, only ATVs are allowed
7 on those wider trails on the Lower Ranch. The reason I
8 was confused is because in the Forest Service, the quad
9 trails, what we consider an ATV trail, is 50 inches or
10 less. They started building a vehicle, a side-by-side
11 ROV that was 50 inches specifically so it could go on
12 those trails. So in a lot of places where they look,
13 we can actually see quads and these smaller ROVs mixed.
14 Most of the ROVs are wider, gives them a little bit
15 more stability, and they can't go on those 50-inch
16 trails.

17 CHAIR LUEDER: Any other questions from other
18 Commissioners?

19 Jared, thank you. I believe this is your first
20 report to the Commission. So I thank you for that and
21 nice job, and we will continue on.

22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Next, if I may, and
23 certainly we're happy to do it, you have the
24 legislation update. You've got another thorough report
25 in your binder. I don't know, just looking at the

1 clock, if you want us to keep moving or you want us to
2 review that?

3 CHAIR LUEDER: I think we should keep moving
4 unless anybody has any questions. Let's keep moving
5 on.

6 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: So that concludes our
7 report.

8 CHAIR LUEDER: We will open it up to public
9 comment.

10 **AGENDA ITEM VI(B) - REPORTS - Public Comments**

11 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Deputy Director and
12 Commissioners, John Stewart, California Association of
13 4-Wheel Drive Clubs. Thank you for the tour yesterday
14 at Heber Dunes, appreciate it. It's a great area for
15 families, and I think it would be a great addition to
16 the State Parks system, and I would encourage the
17 Division to look at more of those strategically placed
18 and some even closer to some of the metropolitan areas,
19 L.A., Riverside, San Diego area and places where those
20 types of parks are much closer to the big centers.

21 Just comment about, you know, talking about the
22 side-by-sides, there is one piece of legislation that
23 the State of California has passed, AB 628, which has
24 allowed the Inyo County to enter into working to create
25 some interconnecting trails with the L.A. Department of

1 Power and Water lands, Bureau of Land Management lands,
2 and the Forest Service lands up in the Inyo area. And
3 a lot of that is to accommodate the rapid growth of the
4 side-by-side vehicles used for touring in that area.
5 So it is something that is coming. It's a major change
6 in the way people are recreating, and it is something
7 that planning what the people are going to be
8 interested in the future is something that's always
9 going to be a challenge to predict. So thank you.

10 ED WALDHEIM: Good morning, Commissioners, Ed
11 Waldheim. On the legislative report, I would like to
12 see that if we start thinking about initiating
13 legislation to change the formula where the grants are
14 going. 15 or 20 percent that goes to the restoration
15 is hideous. What we need to do is in law enforcement.
16 I would like to see us really double the law
17 enforcement funding because that is totally unfunded.
18 \$5.2 million for our entire State of California is
19 totally beyond ridiculous because we have people out
20 there doing whatever they want to do, and they're
21 totally immune because there is nobody out there to
22 catch them. Friends of Jawbone, we have subject to
23 those hideous crimes that happened this last
24 Thanksgiving Day weekend. I could kill them all if I
25 had the chance, but nobody would let me do that. And

1 it's sickening. And Brian said he's going to help me,
2 and I'm going to hold him to it. I need somebody to go
3 out there and catch those guys. We catch them. If the
4 Friends of Jawbone can catch them, why can't the law
5 enforcement catch them, put them in handcuffs, take
6 them away and throw the key away from the jail. It's
7 sickening what's happening out there.

8 The other thing on the training, please do
9 not -- I know you want to go ROV, but you're forgetting
10 the ATVs. We are not enforcing the law as to kids
11 having the certificate. We're not doing that, and
12 we're not doing it because there is no place for the
13 kids to go get the training. They have to pay money.
14 They don't have the money to train. So we're totally
15 neglecting what we put in law a long time ago. And,
16 Paul, you know we did that, and we're not doing the
17 job. Glamis is doing a great job. Dumont Dunes is
18 doing a great job, but after that, it's down the
19 toilet. So we have kids out there constantly riding
20 double, no equipment. It's sickening what's happening
21 out there. You have to be in the field like I'm in the
22 field to find out what's happening.

23 Friends of Jawbone, we continue to have a
24 \$50,000 payroll between Friends of Jawbone and El
25 Mirage, we staff out there every single day working and

1 fixing everything up and maintaining the trails to make
2 sure we keep them open. CTUC, California Trail Users
3 Coalition, we just finished an obstacle course in San
4 Diego Canyon for four-by-fours. So we're really proud
5 about that. We continue having meetings with five
6 national forests and the BLM on a quarterly basis. So
7 the Friends groups are an integral part of what's
8 happening. Thank you.

9 JIM BRAMHAM: What an opportunity to follow Ed.
10 I'm Jim Bramham with my ASA hat on at this moment, and
11 I appreciate the fact that the Commission has done two
12 dunes tours in the last two meetings. We always like
13 to see you come to sand dunes and certainly would like
14 to see you come to the ISDRA, the largest of those at
15 some point. I know you have lots of other
16 opportunities around the state.

17 I was especially appreciative of the training
18 for side-by-sides. We see that as the future in the
19 dunes. We see more and more of those vehicles there,
20 and certainly want to see a way of being able to train
21 people to do that. We're instrumental, as Ed said, in
22 the ISDRA training for ATV training, and if we can
23 incorporate that as well, we see this as more as the
24 exponential growth of these things are just phenomenal.
25 We actually had a big event, Sierra Trek, this year.

1 We had a portion of that event which historically been
2 rock crawling jeeps, also had a run for these
3 side-by-sides. So we know they're coming.

4 And I think one of the things that we are going
5 to try to consider legislatively this year, I don't
6 know how this is going to go, but other states
7 incorporate a law system that if it operates with a
8 steering wheel, you're required to wear seatbelts. If
9 it operates with a handlebar or you sit astride it, you
10 are not. Currently we don't have that here in the
11 state, so side-by-sides can be operated without
12 seatbelts even though they're equipped. So we'd like
13 to see potentially that put in. Not sure we're ready
14 to go with helmets with them, especially if they're
15 operated safely with the harnessing equipment that
16 comes with them, not sure we're ready to step to the
17 helmeting requirement, but certainly would like to see
18 something that mandates that they wear seatbelts.
19 Thank you.

20 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. I think that
21 concludes everything in the Deputy Director's report.
22 We're at 10:15. BLM report.

23 **AGENDA ITEM IV(C) - REPORTS - BLM**

24 BLM JIM KEELER: Good morning, Commissioners and
25 staff. I'm Jim Keeler, Off-Highway Vehicle Lead for

1 California BLM. I'm going to try to keep my report
2 real brief today, but I do want to take one quick
3 opportunity to introduce you to El Centro staff and
4 give them a minute to talk of my time, too.

5 I did want to mention three quick personnel
6 updates for BLM California. We have a new associate
7 state director replacing Jim Abbott's old position as
8 Associate State Director and the number two person in
9 California, which was filled last week, with Angie
10 Lara, who has most recently been the district manager
11 in the Colorado River District. So she probably knows
12 her new boss quite well because she worked for him in
13 Arizona previous to that. She started as a clerk in
14 the Cadastral staff in Sacramento, where she grew up,
15 which is interesting. So she knows California pretty
16 well, but she's been throughout the whole country
17 working with BLM.

18 Steve Anderson, the Redding field manager
19 retired last month, and there's a fairly good biography
20 of him and all three of the people I'm talking about
21 today in the notes that I provided.

22 The third one is Este Stifel, who's worked kind
23 of behind the scenes for BLM in California since
24 December of 2010, has been named as the Central
25 California District Manager replacing Kathy Hardy, so

1 you'll get to know her pretty well. She's fun to work
2 with. She's a real ball-of-fire lady. I like her.

3 Going on, though, I think that probably within
4 BLM there are two really legendary recreation programs,
5 one, of course, is Burning Man and the other is Glamis.
6 And so since we came all the way to El Centro today, I
7 really wanted to take the opportunity to have you meet
8 Margaret Goodro and let her introduce some of her
9 staff, and I hope that at some point we'll come back
10 again through the Big Dog. Anyhow, we're glad to have
11 you down here. Thank you very much.

12 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: I'm Margaret Goodro.
13 I'm the El Centro Field Office manager, and I'm also
14 filling in as the associate district manager for CDD,
15 so welcome on behalf of the California Desert District
16 and on behalf of the El Centro Field Office. I've been
17 with the Bureau for about a year and a half here to
18 El Centro which manages about 1.5 million acres, and
19 Neil Hamada is the dunes manager for the Imperial Sand
20 Dunes, and he'll go over more of the boring statistics,
21 and I'll do more of the flare when he steps back in.

22 So one of the things since I've been here and
23 working on these operations with Imperial Sand Dunes is
24 the many successes. We have great partnerships, and
25 some of those folks are here with Imperial County

1 Sheriff's Office, American Sand Association, UDG. And
2 so some of the things we're going to show you are great
3 successes. One of the big successes that is phenomenal
4 is all of these groups come together to promote safety.
5 We have unified safety messages that we develop
6 annually, and then we have a lot of new ways of getting
7 the word out.

8 One of the programs that we started last year is
9 called the Dune Guard Program where we take rangers,
10 they go out in the field, if they see kids riding safe
11 or showing good responsible behavior, taking care of
12 the resources, we award them with a card, which they
13 take to the ranger station, and they get a Dune Guard
14 T-shirt. And let me tell you, these kids come walking
15 out of the ranger station, they put that shirt on as
16 soon as they get out the door, and they have a huge
17 smile on their face. The kids are loving it. The
18 parents are loving it, and we are trying to award that
19 great behavior, and so generations will now do a better
20 job of being safe and taking care of the resources.
21 And so this is made possible with our partnership with
22 United Desert Gateway, a phenomenal program. The
23 secretary came down this last year. He enjoyed handing
24 out those T-shirts also, so we're going to continue
25 with the Dune Guard Program and hope to expand it into

1 the future.

2 Another thing we're using is educational
3 Frisbees, and we found out that fliers and e-mails
4 don't necessarily catch people's attention. So, again,
5 working through our partnership with United Desert
6 Gateway, we started taking our safety messages and
7 putting them on Frisbees. The kids love the Frisbees,
8 so do the parents. When our officers and rangers and
9 EMS folks are out in the field, they make contact and
10 hand out these. We'd throw them at you, but you might
11 get hurt. And so these have been very successful.
12 We've changed the messages based on those safety issues
13 that we're seeing in the field. And so some of the
14 things that we've been focusing on is the 15 miles an
15 hour within 50 feet of the camps. Another one is
16 "Don't drink and ride." This year there has been some
17 talk about seat belts here, we also in our campaign to
18 make sure that folks are wearing their seatbelts.
19 Carbon monoxide poisoning is another issue that we've
20 seen. It's pretty cool.

21 We're doing new stuff, and it's working. The
22 message is getting out there. Our partnerships are
23 getting tighter and tighter. So it's really neat to
24 see what's going on. And based on the education and
25 enforcement that's been happening over the last ten

1 years at Imperial Sand Dunes, the EMS rates have gone
2 down 50 percent, which is phenomenal. And so they used
3 to be up over 800 calls, now it's under 400 calls. So
4 we see the importance of having consistent education
5 and consistent enforcement to keep those medicals down.
6 And so with an area that receives well over a million
7 visitors, it needs to be trying these new things and
8 see the successes.

9 And so, Neil, would you like to go more of the
10 strategics? And I have for you all, El Centro, we also
11 had a field office coin that was created, so I'll hand
12 those out. And Neil will go over more of the
13 statistics and happy to answer any questions that the
14 Commission may have. And thanks for welcoming me. I
15 appreciate that.

16 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Good morning, thanks for
17 coming down to El Centro once again. Since I think I
18 haven't spoken in front of this Commission before, I'll
19 kind of give you a brief rundown of our area, what kind
20 of opportunities we provide.

21 We manage about 1.4, 1.5 million acres. Most of
22 that is here in Imperial County, but we also go into
23 eastern San Diego County. We have three open areas
24 that we manage: Imperial Sand Dunes, which is about
25 83,000 acres of open riding; Plaster City, 41,000

1 acres, and Superstition Mountain, 13,000 acres.

2 We manage about 3,486 miles of off-highway
3 vehicle routes here in Imperial County. We hold about
4 somewhere between 10 and 20 races, it varies each year,
5 off-highway vehicle races. We have off-highway vehicle
6 appreciation days in the dunes. We have trials events,
7 that's motorcycle, rock crawling type stuff. And
8 several other types of permits that are associated with
9 off-highway vehicles.

10 In our grant applications, we state that we have
11 seven million visitors per year. A 2011 survey in the
12 Imperial Sand Dunes done with the University of Idaho
13 indicated that 82 percent of the visitors to the dunes
14 are satisfied with the services and opportunities that
15 we provide.

16 So Daphne asked me to talk to you a little bit
17 about partnerships. There's almost nothing that we do
18 in the dunes now that we don't do without a partner.
19 American Sand Association, American Desert Foundation,
20 their nonprofit arm; United Desert Gateway,
21 Charla Teeters back there, are a huge help to what we
22 do. So I'm going to go over some of the programs.

23 But first and foremost, our biggest partner, the
24 Off-Highway Vehicle Division, we get about a million
25 dollars a year right here to Imperial County. Our

1 partners back here, the sheriff's department, we work
2 very closely with them in our law enforcement efforts.
3 I'm going to go over some stats here in a bit and maybe
4 Sergeant Fowler will come up. We get funding in
5 safety, education, restoration, ground operations, and
6 planning. And so those make huge positive impacts here
7 in Imperial County.

8 A survey that we did with United Desert Gateway
9 indicated that the visitation that comes to Imperial
10 County through off-highway vehicle recreation
11 stimulates the economy to the tune of about
12 \$200 million per year in our region.

13 Margaret mentioned the OHV training that we do,
14 and it's been a huge success. It's a huge partnership
15 between American Desert Foundation, BLM, private land
16 owners, State Parks. State Parks is funding the
17 grants, the Division. They purchased some signs,
18 electric message boards, that we got from a grant many
19 years ago, we're still using them. Just this past
20 weekend alone, we did 81 students. That's 81 kids
21 trained in ATV safety. Last year we did over 300, so
22 hopefully this year we're going to try to get up to
23 over 500 kids. And that's in Superstition,
24 Gordons Well, and Glamis.

25 Another partnership that we have is with the

1 United Desert Gateway in printing the United Desert
2 Gateway OHV Guide. There's a bunch on the table out
3 back. But we did a survey and asked our visitors how
4 do they want to get their information. About 12 years
5 ago, almost everyone said they wanted to get it through
6 signs and kiosks, and now it's, of course, through the
7 Internet. But second to the Internet is the OHV
8 Recreation Guide. And so in the survey we asked them
9 what do they want to know. Well, we can provide them a
10 lot of things in the map that we send out to them that
11 you have a copy of, but there is certain information we
12 can't provide: Private business names, where I can get
13 my ATV fixed, that kind of thing. Together with Charla
14 and ASA, we put together this guide, and everything
15 that our visitors have asked for is now provided in
16 these two documents.

17 Another partnership is our medical program. We
18 have a ton of partners who provide medical assistance
19 to our visitors in the Imperial Sand Dunes. El Centro
20 Regional Medical Center, Pioneer Memorial Hospital,
21 Gold Cross Ambulance, Real Metro, Reach Air Medical.
22 For these of you on the tour yesterday you saw my flag
23 had the Reach Air Medical symbol on there, these folks
24 are providing staff free of charge to assist the BLM.
25 They're staging a helicopter. We had incredible

1 response times. When there is an individual that's
2 hurt and needs a helicopter, most times it's about a
3 three-minute ETA.

4 An example, I'm going over an incident,
5 reviewing an incident last week. There was an
6 accident. We responded, we were there within five
7 minutes. The patient was en route to a hospital in a
8 helicopter in less than 30. That's the kind of service
9 we're providing. We couldn't do that without our
10 partners. Glamis Storage providing the land for the
11 helicopter. Reach is providing the helicopter and
12 on-the-ground paramedics -- not just in the
13 helicopters --

14 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'm sorry, who brought the
15 helicopter?

16 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Reach Air Medical.

17 COMMISSIONER KERR: That's a private business?

18 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Yes. They put their
19 paramedics in the dune buggy with us so that we can
20 provide advanced life support on the ground.

21 Kawasaki, once again, donated a UTV. That UTV
22 is used in the campground by the campground host who
23 volunteers to maintain our campsites, so interested in
24 the ROV training. Clemson University, Tread Lightly,
25 ASA, and BLM worked together this past year on a Tread

1 Lightly study and how we can improve our Tread Lightly
2 message.

3 To give you an idea of what type of workload we
4 have, I was going to go over some statistics for the
5 sand dunes and some law enforcement stuff. We enjoy a
6 close relationship with the sheriff's department here
7 in Imperial County, we work together. This past
8 holiday we partnered up, we patrolled together, we
9 backed each other up on both EMS and law enforcement
10 calls. In the dunes we get an annual visitation of
11 about 1.5 to 1.2 million, depends on the year.
12 Thanksgiving weekend we had 142,000 visitors, and we
13 have a pretty small office, so it's a huge ordeal for
14 us to ramp up and prepare for that. We double the size
15 of the county just with our visitation. Over
16 Thanksgiving, BLM wrote 927 citations.

17 ICSO SGT. FOWLER: Imperial County Sheriff wrote
18 209 citations.

19 BLM NEIL HAMADA: BLM had 43 arrests.

20 ICSO SGT. FOWLER: Imperial County Sheriff had
21 11 arrests.

22 BLM NEIL HAMADA: And within those arrests were
23 also 16 DUIs, and we had a staff of about 130 folks to
24 assist those people. And that staff includes, of
25 course, the sheriff's department, BLM, Forest Service,

1 all of our private partners, over 20 more BORSTAR,
2 Border Patrol Search and Rescue Team. So BLM pays for
3 some of that staff, the sheriff pays for some of that
4 staff, and some of that staff comes out is paid for by
5 the home agency, home unit or private company. So
6 we're all working together to get this job done.

7 On the EMS side, we had 86 calls in the dunes,
8 86 calls total. Six of those were on the west side, 80
9 in the sand dunes. Five of those were air transported,
10 and 42 of those were signed and released meaning they
11 were minimal injuries. So about half were really minor
12 injuries. They drove themselves to the hospital or
13 didn't need assistance.

14 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Neil, can you remind
15 me how many citations were issued again between both
16 departments?

17 BLM NEIL HAMADA: 927 for BLM, and 209 for ICSO,
18 Imperial County Sheriff's Office.

19 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: That's quite a few.
20 What is the majority of the citations? Is there
21 anything that stands out?

22 ICSO SGT. FOWLER: My name is Cheryl Fowler.
23 I'm a sergeant with Imperial County Sheriff's Office.

24 CHAIR LUEDER: Welcome, thank you.

25 BLM NEIL HAMADA: We try to focus on the safety

1 items and of course registration. We do a lot of
2 registration violations. But safety items like no
3 light riding at night, safety flags, helmets. Of
4 course, our fee program, we wrote about 100 citations
5 for fees, spark arresters, those kinds of things. We
6 do make thousands and thousands of contacts or ATV
7 certifications for kids. And so it really runs the
8 gamut.

9 And then Daphne also asked me to speak off the
10 cuff a little bit on some of the improvements of what
11 I've seen out there. Our friend, Ranger Vic, yesterday
12 he mentioned some of the things that have occurred out
13 in the dunes in the past. And Sergeant Fowler is a
14 witness to some of those things. Back in 2001, The
15 New York Times come out and said it was the most
16 illegal place in the world, and he was correct.
17 However, New York Times was out this past weekend, and
18 they're preparing a story to show how it's improved and
19 how much better it is. That story is supposed to come
20 out in December.

21 I was out there this past weekend and working.
22 Some of the quotes that I got from visitors while I was
23 patrolling passing out Frisbees was: "We haven't come
24 to Glamis in 10, 15 years. We're coming back now
25 because of the changes." "I used to camp in Gordons

1 Well or Buttercup because Glamis is too crazy. Now we
2 come back to Glamis every month." So those are the
3 kinds of quotes we're getting. We're getting a lot of
4 positive feedback. We're getting people coming into
5 the ranger station to get safety information. We're
6 making contacts for the ATV safety classes to tell kids
7 and their parents that they need to have the training,
8 they already have the card, they already took the
9 training.

10 And so we've seen a huge change. As Margaret
11 said, 800 medicals a year to 400 medicals a year.
12 That's a huge, huge improvement for us. We've
13 decreased our EMS staffing numbers because there isn't
14 as many accidents, and so it's been a big change. It's
15 been a big workload. We still have issues. When you
16 have 142,000 people riding off-highway vehicles, of
17 course, we're going to have some issues, and we're
18 addressing those together with the Sheriff's
19 Department --

20 COMMISSIONER KERR: So you mentioned fees. So
21 these 142,000 people paid you something to come there?

22 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Correct, we have a fee
23 program. Just to give you kind of a rundown of the fee
24 program, last year about 65 percent of our revenues
25 came from fees, about 19 percent came from federal, and

1 about 16 percent came from grants from the OHV
2 Division.

3 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: What are the fees?

4 BLM NEIL HAMADA: The fees are \$25 a week or \$90
5 a season if you buy your permit prior to arrival. If
6 you buy the permit onsite, it's \$40 a week or \$120 for
7 a season.

8 COMMISSIONER KERR: So if you want to come into
9 the dunes, you buy the weekly permit.

10 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Correct, or season, it's up to
11 you. It's normally about 80 percent week permit sales
12 and 20 percent season permit sales. And about 75
13 percent of those permits now are sold offsite. That's
14 another huge economic generator for our local
15 community. We're trying to get those people to stop in
16 our local towns, and the folks in the towns that own
17 the stores are saying about 75 to 80 percent of the
18 people that stop to buy a permit in their gas station
19 or their market or bike shop are also buying fuel,
20 groceries, safety flags, helmets, goggles, those types
21 of thing. So that's a huge economic boost for our
22 local economy and our neighbors here in Imperial
23 County.

24 CHAIR LUEDER: Any questions for Neil? Thank
25 you, Neil.

1 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'd like to say that looking
2 at those percentages would be valuable as we review our
3 operations around the state. So I think what he said
4 was 65 percent of his total budget comes from basically
5 gate receipts, correct? I don't think we're
6 approaching those numbers, but I thought it would be --
7 it's interesting to see how they're running that
8 because they've got a desirable, successful recreating
9 area, and they're charging accordingly.

10 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I'd like to make a
11 comment. Neil, how long have you been at Glamis?

12 BLM NEIL HAMADA: I've been working out there
13 17 years.

14 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: From my experience, most
15 government agency people get moved around quite a bit.
16 You've been there the whole time. You know, I don't
17 know how much the recreating public understands how
18 important you are to the overall operation of that
19 thing, but you folks out there, you've got a real asset
20 here, and I hope you're appreciating it as much as I've
21 appreciated you over the years. Thank you for being
22 there.

23 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Thank you.

24 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: If I may, in the handout
25 here you will see on page seven they're talking about

1 the nonprofits, the American Desert Foundation, and
2 that's a nonprofit who offers the ATV safety training.
3 Nonprofits are able to apply for the safety training
4 grants, and so it's been very successful. It's another
5 way we can partner and get other organizations to
6 provide important safety training. And so we're
7 working on it, and I know Mr. Waldheim referenced it
8 earlier.

9 I think part of the challenge that we have are
10 looking at some of those remote areas perhaps where we
11 need to make sure that we're getting, again, the safety
12 training is available. I certainly know that the
13 industry provides the safety training when you purchase
14 the ATV. The state provides the safety training if you
15 have a used ATV. There really is no excuse, and we've
16 worked very hard with ASI to provide that safety
17 training. So if there are areas and if the members of
18 the public hear of areas where they're continuing to
19 have frustrations with not being able to get that
20 training, we certainly would like to hear because it is
21 something that we have diligently pursued in order to
22 make sure that safety training is available.

23 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'm glad you mentioned the
24 nonprofits. Obviously you have a successful program
25 here. Is it Neil? Could you tell me -- so you've got

1 this budget. What is the overall budget?

2 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Well, it can vary year to
3 year, and it really depends on --

4 COMMISSIONER KERR: Just round numbers.

5 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Five to six million.

6 COMMISSIONER KERR: So you've got a \$6 million
7 in that. 65 percent is covered by gate receipts; is
8 that correct?

9 BLM NEIL HAMADA: This past fiscal year '11 it
10 was, yes.

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: In some of the parks -- and
12 you're not a park, per se, but you sort of are -- have
13 companion nonprofits that participate and help with
14 facilities and in some cases they're a large
15 contributor to -- like of the six million, how much of
16 that is covered by nonprofits or is that a separate
17 budget?

18 BLM NEIL HAMADA: I don't have the number for
19 FY '11 here; however, we've done it in the past, but
20 we've lumped together volunteer hours, as well. We
21 have significant volunteer projects in the Imperial
22 Sand Dunes, and those volunteer hours are worth about
23 \$22 an hour. So we totalled it in that measure, and I
24 believe in FY '10 -- Nicole might be able to help me --
25 I want to say it was in the neighborhood \$750,000 to

1 \$800,000 in value from partners.

2 COMMISSIONER KERR: But there are no people like
3 organizations building buildings or doing in...

4 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Yes, yes. We had a nonprofit
5 organization called Chris "Chili Dog" Frick, who was an
6 individual who passed away. His friends started a
7 nonprofit organization. That's who we work under in
8 our MOU for all of the medical services. That
9 nonprofit organization built us a storage shed so that
10 we have a place to store our rescue buggies. They
11 built us a two-room medical facility at our ranger
12 station, so there are some nonprofits out there.

13 United Desert Gateway basically took over the
14 construction process after the ranger station itself
15 was built in the Buttercup and built us a shed for our
16 ranger buggies and for our EMS buggies, as well as the
17 parking lot structures for both the front and the rear
18 of the facility.

19 COMMISSIONER KERR: How did they fund it?

20 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Actually, the American Sand
21 Association had lobbied for a congressional add-on and
22 received it, and it went through Federal Highways.

23 COMMISSIONER KERR: So the nonprofit got a
24 grant?

25 BLM NEIL HAMADA: Basically. And they also get

1 other grants, as well. That's not the limiting.
2 Charla puts in for several grants a year, and we also
3 get smaller projects. For instance, the paper you have
4 in front of you there, I believe that one was funded by
5 Polaris Corporation.

6 CHAIR LUEDER: Thank you, Neil.

7 Margaret, do you have anything to add to close?

8 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: Just to close, on
9 behalf of the Bureau, this is an excellent example of a
10 lot of folks coming together to promote safety and
11 recreation. And so public service is very important to
12 us, and we feel public service is the backbone of
13 America, and recreation helps fuel the soul of America.
14 So we enjoy the hard work and we enjoy providing that
15 safe recreation. So we continue to learn and do things
16 better, and we love these opportunities to share our
17 successes and learn more. So thank you for having us.

18 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I have a question. The
19 permit fee situation that's been ongoing, can you speak
20 to that in your specific area of responsibility?

21 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: Sure. As for the
22 Bureau of Land Management through FLERA, and that's how
23 we charge fees, and so it's not a gate fee as compared
24 to other park areas where they do an entrance fee. In
25 the Imperial Sand Dunes, it's a special recreation

1 permit. So it's called an individual special
2 recreational permit, so that's authorized for the main
3 vehicle. And so it's not an entrance fee. It's not a
4 camping fee. It's a special recreation permit, and
5 that's for Imperial Sand Dunes.

6 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I'm sorry, I was really
7 meaning the special use fee, permit fees for special
8 events.

9 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: That's another SRP.
10 We have multiple types of special recreational permits.
11 We have special recreational permits for events for
12 vendors, and so that would include something like a
13 car/truck race. And so we have laws, regulations, and
14 policies, and that comes from 43 CFR which dictates how
15 we manage those programs and how we issue those
16 permits, which requires they are submitted 180 days in
17 advance. Then we review the complete application
18 packet, and we go through the system of whether there
19 would be a cost recovery. If it takes over 50 hours of
20 federal time to monitor and process the permit, then it
21 goes into cost recovery.

22 We have several different permits. We have
23 upward around about 100 vendor SRPs. And then for
24 events, we have about 35. For races, we do about 20.
25 So they're all a little bit different. Some of those,

1 there is a fee charged under cost recovery, which is
2 obligated by law. For some of those that fall under
3 the 50 hours, there is not a fee, which would be like a
4 Rocket Tree permit for a small desert scramble. That
5 doesn't require as much resources and monitoring.

6 And there's been a big push with the Bureau in
7 reviewing our programs and ensuring that we follow the
8 laws, regulations, and policies, and again that we're
9 promoting that safe environment. We want to continue
10 to see OHV recreation be safe and responsible. And so
11 that folds into that also as we are processing all of
12 those applications. Did that cover your question?

13 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: There's been a pretty big
14 issue in the OHV community, and I'm talking about
15 competitive motorcycle events, not necessarily the big
16 car events and stuff, but the ones that are operated by
17 nonprofits as opposed to profit-making organizations,
18 that they're pretty much being put out of business
19 because of this cost recovery in the Forest Service and
20 BLM up and down all over the country.

21 And I've been approached by individuals that
22 work in clubs, not necessarily here down in this part
23 of the country, but more in the District 37 area,
24 Mojave Desert, that they're up against a wall. They
25 can't meet all of the requirements, and they think

1 really off-highway vehicle racing as they've known it
2 is maybe a thing of the past here in the near future.

3 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: Well, we work really
4 closely -- we're District 38 here. We work pretty
5 closely with them. I've put on training sessions for
6 their different leaders of their organizations and how
7 to submit the applications. And a lot of those
8 applications actually don't fall under cost recovery
9 because they're under the 50 hours, but the Bureau will
10 ensure that we are putting forward safe events. And so
11 there are -- there needs to be an operations plan,
12 there needs to be EMS plan, and we need to ensure that
13 we're mandated to monitor the events to make sure that
14 those plans are executed correctly.

15 And so in the majority of -- when you talk about
16 the motorcycle races with District 38, a lot of those
17 are not falling under cost recovery when all of those
18 things are done. But if you take a difference between,
19 let's say, a 15-mile or 25-mile scramble as compared to
20 105-mile international it's a lot different. You're
21 talking about much more resources, much more people
22 power out there monitoring. And so there's lots of
23 ways to submit applications to keep those costs down.
24 And we work closely with our folks to help them through
25 that process.

1 And so we've been hosting -- last year, with all
2 of this attention, we had over 20 different permits and
3 races, and so they're happening here, and we want to
4 see that continue. But safety and our monitoring and
5 following the laws, regulations, and policies will
6 continue. And so if there is something that we can do
7 to help your district, we're more than happy to do that
8 also, but it's actually been really neat to work
9 closely with District 38, and a lot of times they come
10 up with some good suggestions, and we tie that in, and
11 Dallas has done an amazing job. So we're actually very
12 happy in the direction that it's going in that we're
13 able to continue to put on safe races.

14 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Just two follow-up
15 questions, if I may. Could you just give an update on
16 the recreational management plan and where you are
17 because the Commission had submitted a letter some time
18 ago. And then also just an overview for those
19 Commissioners that may not know in terms of the
20 resource programs that you have out at Imperial.

21 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: Okay. So. What
22 Daphne is referring to is the RMP for Imperial Sand
23 Dunes, and we were required to go back and do a new one
24 through court. That was a court order. So hopefully
25 we'd like to see that finalized and out in the

1 beginning of the new year. As you know, there's been a
2 lot of different attention to resources and protecting
3 resources, endangered species, threatened and
4 endangered plants. So in Imperial Sand Dunes, we have
5 areas that with the Pearson's milk vetch that are
6 closed to protect that. And in this new plan, it has
7 several possibilities going forward of how to continue
8 to protect the critical habitat and allow for OHV
9 recreation. And so we hope to have that out hitting
10 the streets in the beginning of the new year. Did that
11 answer both your questions?

12 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Does that mean in the
14 new plan that maybe some of the closed areas are going
15 to be reopened and managed differently?

16 BLM FIELD MANAGER GOODRO: Yes, that's a
17 possibility. Right now we have the areas that were
18 closed because of the litigation. And so in this plan
19 coming forward, our goal was to protect that critical
20 habitat but also be able to provide for OHV recreation.
21 And so hopefully we will find a nice mix in there for
22 the future that would appease all parties is the goal.

23 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. Any other comments
24 for BLM? Just want to take a moment to thank you and
25 all of the staff at BLM for the continued partnership,

1 and also for Neil for coming out to our tour yesterday;
2 and look forward to continuing the great work that
3 you're doing. So we're going to take a 15-minute
4 break.

5 (Returned at 11:10 from break starting at 10:52.)

6 **AGENDA ITEM VI(C) - Public Comment**

7 CHAIR LUEDER: Public comment on the BLM report.

8 TERRY WEINER: Hi, Terry Weiner, Desert
9 Protective Council. Thank you for this great meeting.
10 I'm learning a lot even about El Centro BLM. I really
11 am excited about the Heber Dunes new SVRA. I've been
12 there. Sorry I couldn't make the tour yesterday. I
13 think it's a great location and a good opportunity, and
14 it provides for a need for the community, the local
15 community, as well as people from out of the area. And
16 I'm glad that the area that has some mesquite and other
17 native plants left is out of the way and being
18 protected.

19 I wanted to comment on the Algodones Dunes, also
20 known as Imperial Sand Dunes area. I'm looking forward
21 to working with Margaret and the BLM El Centro this
22 year. After the management plan comes out, I'm looking
23 forward to seeing whether or not the BLM took our
24 suggestions. Being I have definitely had fun on dune
25 buggies out in the dunes, but I also am a hiker, and I

1 know it's a sort of unfathomable to some people, but
2 the Algodones Dunes has a wilderness area and there are
3 plants that live there and in the southern dunes that
4 don't live anywhere else in the world, and some
5 beetles, as well. And it's a fascinating area to go
6 and walk around. There is nothing like being in the
7 middle of those dunes, as you all know, to feel like
8 you're removed from everything else.

9 But what I would like to work on is getting --
10 making the wilderness area more accessible to hikers.
11 There really isn't any good parking places, and there
12 aren't any kiosks, and the dunes are not promoted as
13 much for their attraction for the natural resources and
14 the beauty as they are for recreation. I think that
15 you can draw even more tourists to the county,
16 foreigners especially, who like wild places to come and
17 talk a walk in the dunes in a safe place. So I'm going
18 to keep lobbying for providing for that and promoting
19 that part of the resource, and I know I only have three
20 minutes.

21 So on the special recreation permit fees, I
22 think they're a great idea, and they obviously help
23 defray the cost of toilets and the dumpster pickups.
24 And I really wish that other BLM areas and other SVRAs
25 would charge a special permit fee, too. But just know

1 that people are going to hike, we don't use the
2 amenities, we don't go into the campgrounds where the
3 off-roaders are, we don't use the dumpsters or the
4 toilets way out on the other side of Highway 78. And
5 so we have to pay \$25, too. And arguably, and I don't
6 mind subsidizing our public lands, but a lot of people
7 have trouble with the concept of paying \$25 a day to go
8 hiking on public land where that doesn't exist anywhere
9 else without any amenities.

10 So I'm going to thank Margaret and her staff for
11 really beefing up safety, education, and law
12 enforcement and looking forward to getting out in the
13 field with Margaret. We've been planning it for some
14 time, definitely going to do it I hope in 2012. Thank
15 you.

16 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And just if I may,
17 unfortunately our timer is out today, so Connie is our
18 person. And so two-and-a-half minutes, you'll sort of
19 raise your hand and let you know at three minutes. So
20 my apologies.

21 NICOLE NICHOLAS GILLES: Hi, my name is Nicole
22 Nicholas Gilles, and I'm with the American Sand
23 Association. I'm the executive director, and I welcome
24 you to the Imperial Valley and appreciate you being
25 here today and taking the time out of your schedules.

1 There are just a couple of things I wanted to
2 comment on. One was one of the questions I think that
3 Kane had in reference to the amount of citations that
4 were issued over the Thanksgiving holiday, I think the
5 collective number between the BLM and the sheriff's
6 office was somewhere around a thousand. And compared
7 to the amount of visitors, that's still less than one
8 percent of the total amount of people that were there.
9 So if you think about it in those terms, it's not
10 really that many. And so I want to thank the Bureau of
11 Land Management and the sheriff's office for doing an
12 outstanding job and making sure that we have a safe
13 place to recreate.

14 I wanted to also just talk a little bit about
15 the partnerships because that was a lot of what Neil
16 was talking about, and I don't want to be repetitive.
17 But I have a special interest in the United Desert
18 Gateway, since prior to me coming on board with the
19 American Sand Association, I was the CEO of the Brawley
20 Chamber of Commerce, and I'm one of the cofounders of
21 the United Desert Gateway. And Charla Teeters is our
22 project manager, and she might come up and say a few
23 words in a little bit. She's doing a fantastic job.

24 I just wanted to kind of bring your attention --
25 and I'll hand these out. Charla puts together, as a

1 collaboration with the Bureau of Land Management, a
2 really great Partners in Action booklet, and I have a
3 booklet for each one of you. And it talks about all of
4 the different partnerships and the different projects
5 that we've done to date. And the ASA helped basically
6 put the United Desert Gateway concept together because
7 who better to want to recognize the people that are
8 spending money in the counties than the chambers of
9 commerce. And like Neil said before, the BLM can't
10 recommend you go to X, Y, Z business to fix your buggy
11 or something, but the chambers of commerce can. So the
12 UDG Guide that you have there, the off-road guide, has
13 a list of all of the businesses that support the
14 off-road community in the back, so that's very helpful,
15 as well. We also include information on State Parks in
16 there.

17 As far as going back to the Partners in Action
18 booklet, to date the total contribution from the United
19 Desert Gateway, two different types of projects such as
20 education and public safety for like the highway
21 billboard program. We have a Leo the Lizard, which is
22 like a children's educational safety program. We have
23 signage. We've helped with kiosks out at the dunes.
24 We've helped get drinking water for the rangers out
25 there. I mean there's huge amounts of projects. The

1 total is \$1.6 million is money that hasn't been spent
2 by anyone other than people that are partners and have
3 an interest in trying to make the Imperial Sand Dunes
4 Recreational Area a better place to recreate.

5 And so there's a chronology of events here.
6 There's a list of all of the different types of
7 partnerships. It has some more information about the
8 Chris "Chili Dog" Frick partnership that Neil was
9 talking about that's in conjunction with the local
10 hospitals and with the Reach Helicopter service. And
11 so I have copies of these for you to take home with
12 you, some nice nighttime reading material I'm sure.

13 And I just want to again thank you for being
14 here and taking time to come out and see what's going
15 on down here. I mean just keep in mind when you are
16 thinking about things that affect this area, that it is
17 still the highest visited recreation area in the state
18 with the lowest funding. So any type of partnership
19 that we have, Parks is a huge example, goes miles for
20 us, because we wouldn't be able to do it without
21 funding that we receive from our partners.

22 So I thank you very much for your time. And if
23 you have any questions, I'd be happy to answer them at
24 this time.

25 ED WALDHEIM: Ed Waldheim, Friends of Jawbone,

1 Friends of El Mirage, and CTUC. The partnership that
2 we have with the BLM is incredible starting with
3 Friends of El Mirage. We continue to run that Visitor
4 Center and the one in Jawbone 365 days a year. We're
5 always open in that area. The visitors have kind of
6 dropped in the El Mirage area. We've seen about a
7 30 percent drop in visitors coming in. How do we know
8 that, because of the fees that are collected in that
9 area.

10 We have staff out there on the weekends, goes
11 and talks with everyone, picks up trash, and tells them
12 about illegal things that people are doing. We work on
13 the ambassador program. We work on the Junior Ranger
14 Program. We're constantly training those kids. The
15 only missing link that we've got going is that ATV
16 safety. We've got to figure out how we get that one
17 going there.

18 Jawbone, that's an incredible job, we have staff
19 working in the field every day. 11 people show up at
20 6:30 in the morning at the Visitor Center. We have to
21 go and send them on their assignments, and they're
22 doing very, very well, fixing fences, doing trail
23 maintenance, picking up trash, doing trail maintenance.
24 We've dug over 150 miles of trail maintenance already
25 since August 1st when the grants program started. That

1 area, this weekend we had close to 20,000 people showed
2 up there. California City had over 100,000 people
3 showed up in California City alone. The week before
4 Thanksgiving, they sold 5,000 passes. They had a
5 little green sticker type program for California City
6 cost you \$10 to buy for a year for a motorcycle. They
7 sold close to 10,000 of those just over the
8 Thanksgiving Day weekend.

9 So when you put the two together between the BLM
10 and California City, you've got 120, 150,000 people
11 who've come through East Kern. The fact is when you
12 get on the freeway coming back home on Sunday, all you
13 have is just trailer after trailer. It's just a jam
14 going through Mojave. It's phenomenal what's happening
15 in there.

16 Similar, you asked questions about SVRAs asking
17 for how do you contact the customers. We work very
18 hard on that. We have about 1600 e-mails for Jawbone,
19 about 1200 e-mails for El Mirage. We send monthly or
20 every other month we send a newsletter to all of those
21 visitors and tell them what's going on, so we keep them
22 informed.

23 Where are visitors coming from, both areas,
24 30 percent come from L.A. County. El Mirage and
25 Jawbone, the same thing. The next one would be San

1 Bernardino for El Mirage, and the next one would be
2 Kern County for Jawbone. So 30 percent of our visitors
3 come from the Los Angeles Basin, and we have to make
4 sure the politicians and Parks and Recreation folks in
5 those counties know about that. So it's very
6 important.

7 In Kern County, sheriffs are incredible asset to
8 us. They help us there to manage, to do the
9 patrolling, but they don't have enough funding. And
10 Eric asked me, let's find out how much they need to
11 really have a bigger presence because BLM is totally
12 short funded as far as their law enforcement people
13 are, so that's something I'm going to work on to see if
14 I can get that going.

15 And on your calendar please write down April 28
16 of next year is when we have our grand opening of our
17 Visitor Center again. Remember, we spent a million
18 dollars for remodeling. Our shop is done, 6,000 square
19 foot. We're working on the 800 square feet of the
20 Interpretive Center, so we're going to have the grand
21 opening on the 28th, hope everybody can come to that
22 one and make a big thing on that, okay? Thank you.

23 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners,
24 Deputy Director, John Stewart, California Association
25 of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs. Mention has been made about

1 the different fees that apply through the BLM areas,
2 one of the previous speakers mentioned that hikers
3 don't use amenities and yet immediately followed by a
4 request to provide parking lots and kiosks. Kiosks and
5 parking lots are amenities that do cost money.
6 Somebody has got to pay for them.

7 Overall looking at the fee issue, though, while
8 I'm not opposed to fees, I believe if you're going to
9 use something, you should be paying for it. If you
10 want extra special facilities, yes, you should pay for
11 it over and above a certain point. I would urge
12 caution, though, when you start looking at fees and
13 really address them, is to not overprice the fees for
14 the value provided for the user that is going to pay
15 them. Once they see that they are not receiving a
16 value, they will go to someplace else where they don't
17 have to pay that fee, and I think it's better to direct
18 the people for where you want them to recreate and
19 encourage them to go where you want them to recreate,
20 rather than to have them out there searching for a
21 place where they can create or will create their own
22 recreation opportunity possibly in an area where you
23 don't want them to be. So as far as the land managers
24 when they start talking about fees, this is something
25 that's got to be approached with caution and studied

1 very close.

2 And also with the BLM, I'm kind of, well, a
3 little disappointed that the BLM was not providing a
4 more in-depth update on some of the other issues
5 affecting recreation in the desert area, being the West
6 Mojave Plan, and the new update on the trail inventory
7 that is in progress, and also for the renewable energy
8 issues. I believe these are issues that are not
9 receiving the appropriate amount of attention, and
10 they're going to have a significant impact on
11 recreation in the years to come. Thank you.

12 CHAIR LUEDER: That concludes Item No. C, BLM
13 report.

14 And we are past our 11:00 a.m. public comment
15 period, so we're going to start that now. So this is
16 for items that are not on the agenda today. And if
17 there's anybody else that has not filled out a blue
18 card that wants to speak, please do that now.

19 **AGENDA ITEM - PUBLIC COMMENT**

20 CHARLA TEETERS: Good morning, my name is
21 Charla Teeters. I'm the program manager for the United
22 Desert Gateway. I probably should have been on the end
23 of the BLM report, but it doesn't matter. I just want
24 to introduce myself. You've been given plenty of
25 information. You have all of the handouts I would have

1 given you.

2 And I just wanted to speak briefly about the
3 partnerships are obviously a big deal for our area, is
4 a big benefit for our area. United Desert Gateway is
5 always happy to work with the BLM and with State Parks.
6 We list you all in our guides so that everybody can get
7 a good map of your area and contact information. And I
8 really don't have a whole lot to say. I just wanted to
9 introduce myself. If you had any questions about the
10 United Desert Gateway, our partnerships, and our
11 assistant agreement with the BLM or anything like that,
12 I would be happy to answer those questions.

13 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I do have a brief question
14 or it's more of a comment. Are you affiliated on a
15 statewide level with other gateway, chambers of
16 commerce kinds of things?

17 CHARLA TEETERS: No. The UDG is comprised of
18 the Brawley, El Centro, and Yuma Chambers of Commerce,
19 and it was designed that way because we're the gateway
20 communities to the ISDRA.

21 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I don't know if you're
22 familiar with the California Parks Recreation Tourism
23 Council.

24 CHARLA TEETERS: I'm familiar with the
25 organization.

1 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Those are the kinds of
2 things that they bring people like you together and
3 talk about some of the issues and trying to help spread
4 that. You might look into that.

5 CHARLA TEETERS: Yes, that's actually a very
6 good suggestion. Thank you.

7 ED WALDHEIM: Ed Waldheim. The West Mojave
8 Plan, that baby is finished on the 25th. We did all of
9 the signing. Now we are working on the redesignation
10 or relooking at all of the routes for parts of the BLM
11 Ridgecrest. The DAC is meeting on Saturday, and
12 they're thinking about moving on to a subgroup for the
13 West Mojave Plan, so we can start working with them as
14 a group together to redesignate or validate what we
15 have done out there in the field. So that meeting is
16 on the 3rd.

17 The Governor's meeting is going to take place in
18 Yucaipa on December the 7th, and they are going to talk
19 about recreation, and they have a panel made up of the
20 supervisors in San Bernardino County, and DPR, and
21 National Parks Service. And I'm trying to figure out
22 how we can get on there for recreation from our side of
23 it. That's going to go on the 7th all day in Yucaipa.

24 The main issue I want to talk about is the
25 DRECP. This is a big gorilla. This is one that's

1 coming down and taking all of our rights away no matter
2 who you are, if you're in agriculture or whatever you
3 are. They've looked at 22 million acres that they're
4 looking for DRECP, Desert Renewable Energy Conservation
5 Plan. They've been meeting every month, two days,
6 three days at a time. And on the 14th, the big meeting
7 is going to take place in Ontario, and recreation is
8 finally getting a chance to make our case. So we are
9 working on coming up with a PowerPoint presentation
10 because they are planning on taking out 4,000 acres
11 away from SVRAs. They're taking away 16,899 acres away
12 from open area, including 2300 acres from El Mirage.
13 They want to take away 265,000 acres from my limited
14 use area. Agricultural, everybody gets touched by this
15 thing. It was the biggest fraud I've never seen in my
16 life. Somehow we've got to make sure we get through to
17 these people that, you know, there is more in the world
18 than just these windmills and these solar panels.
19 There's a whole life of people. There's a whole life
20 of animals. It's totally crazy.

21 So this one I just wanted to share with you.
22 You can go online and go look at it. Daphne can
23 provide you with the online thing and avail yourself on
24 what is going on. I'm trying to get as many people as
25 possible to go to that meeting on the 14th to let them

1 know the silent majority haven't even spoken because
2 we've been kind of excluded. And we've kind of worked
3 in Daphne. She got appointed or she got worked in
4 there. We have Randy Bannis is working for CORVA in
5 there, and we have Dave Beaumont. So it's a small
6 amount of us carrying the big baton for that incredible
7 project. Please, Daphne, if you would get the
8 Commissioners' links so they can go avail themselves.
9 If you're available come to the 14th, please, to the
10 meeting. We need as many people from the audience to
11 come to Ontario. If you need the address on that, I
12 have it over here, and I can give it to you. We need a
13 show of great force. I don't care if you ride or you
14 don't ride, it's access to the public land that is
15 totally at jeopardy right now.

16 TERRY WEINER: Terry Weiner. I'm kind of
17 excited by what Ed is excited about. I think I see a
18 real opportunity for forming an alliance in response to
19 the huge what I'm going to call disaster and
20 boondoggle, which is the federal government.

21 The DRECP is the state plan for renewable
22 energy, but the federal government has a plan to
23 develop solar and wind throughout the desert of the
24 southwest, and I encourage everybody to attend meetings
25 that are happening next week on the programmatic

1 environmental impact statement, which is their big plan
2 to carve up the desert for solar energy zones. This is
3 like the biggest boondoggle that's been hoisted on the
4 public coming down the pike.

5 And part of it I think comes from the people in
6 Washington and people in Sacramento not really
7 appreciating the desert, you know. I'm sure you've
8 noticed over the years that every plan that they don't
9 want to see in the city, track dumps, nuclear waste
10 dumps, digging for water, gets foisted on the deserts.
11 Anyway, in response to this threat I helped cofound a
12 group called Solar Done Right.

13 And what's happening here is we're going about
14 this movement toward renewable energy backwards.
15 California has a loading order which is you start with
16 energy efficiency, upgrading your homes to be more
17 energy efficient, conservation of energy. We don't
18 need the air conditioning in all places at all times.
19 We don't need all of the lighting that we have
20 everywhere and so forth. And then you do the rooftop
21 solar and local distributed generation, building solar
22 close to and in the cities, and then you if you still
23 need more energy, you do some remote site. The
24 Environmental Protection Agency in their response to
25 the original programmatic EIS said, look, there is over

1 a million acres of land in this country that's brown
2 fields and other toxic lands, ag land that's poisoned
3 with selenium, we should put any big projects there.

4 We're all going to be hampered by this,
5 especially in Imperial County. We're planning a 12,000
6 acre wind project over west of Ocotillo, north of
7 Ocotillo, south on absolutely beautiful BLM land, which
8 is a quarter for bighorn sheep, surrounded by
9 wilderness. It also has designated ROV routes on it.
10 This is a terrible tragedy.

11 The NEPA document for the programmatic EIS is
12 flawed, and what I'm going to say in El Centro on the
13 7th is that you didn't complete the NEPA alternatives,
14 but they're required to mention alternatives that are
15 outside of their jurisdiction. So they did not analyze
16 all of the renewable energy available in California on
17 rooftops and in cities. They didn't even consider that
18 and these transmission lines by the way are going to be
19 all paid for by the ratepayers.

20 Anyway, I wanted to direct everybody to Solar
21 Done Right website. We're going to put up talking
22 points for the EIS meetings. And by the way, the solar
23 energy zones, that isn't just the end of it there. The
24 developers, if they can't find suitable sites in the
25 solar energy zones in the desert, they could get

1 variances, which means that basically the whole desert,
2 22 million acres, will be open. Thank you.

3 JOHN STEWART: Good morning, Commissioners, John
4 Stewart, California Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs.
5 One thing that's not on the agenda this morning or
6 today is the Forest Service. They're not even here.
7 This is about the second meeting I believe that they
8 have not been here, and they have not provided a report
9 for the public to view of what is going on. A lot has
10 been said today about partnerships. It's very
11 important that we do have and maintain partnerships.
12 And the fact that Forest Service has deemed it that
13 they somehow cannot afford to come here is kind of a
14 slap at the partnerships that the Commission and the
15 use community are trying to build in order to promote
16 and protect the motorized recreation throughout the
17 state.

18 I would encourage the Deputy Director and the
19 Division to see about getting the Forest Service here
20 with a full report about what they're doing. They are
21 involved in a lot of activities that should be
22 daylighted to the public because they will affect
23 motorized recreation, and it's important to have all
24 partners at the table as we discuss these issues.
25 Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: Mr. Waldheim had
2 mentioned that 4,000 acres were potentially going to be
3 impacted by the Desert Energy Plan, and I was just
4 wondering if Deputy Director could just comment on
5 that.

6 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: That's an ongoing
7 discussion. As Ed alluded, they are looking at the
8 DRECP plan. The study area is looking at 22 million
9 acres within the desert. The BLM within looking at the
10 plan, they separated out the BLM, OHV areas. They
11 began by separating out the State Park units, the
12 SVRAs. This is an ongoing discussion. Our hope is
13 that this will be adjusted because the SVRAs are
14 legislatively, legally protected, and it's not
15 exhibited in the way that it's come out right now in
16 the DRECP. So stay tuned, we'll keep you apprised of
17 how that turns out, but the goal is that those lands,
18 as what you're doing today with the general plan, the
19 SVRAs are just like the rest of the State Park units
20 and should be treated as such.

21 CHAIR LUEDER: That concludes our public comment
22 period. I'm going to return back to Item D, U.S.
23 Forest Service report and note that there's no
24 representative from the Forest Service nor is there a
25 report. Is there any further comments from staff on

1 U.S. Forest Service report?

2 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: No. Obviously, Imperial
3 County is a remote part of the state, and I think the
4 Forest Service felt from the Vallejo office that their
5 funding -- actually, it would be our funds granted to
6 them -- were better spent elsewhere. As always,
7 discussions with the Forest Service are ongoing about a
8 variety of issues, everything from the PCT to the state
9 water waiver that we're looking at now for Forest
10 Service lands. So my hope is that as we look at the
11 schedule for next year, we will be able to have
12 meetings perhaps in the Forest Service areas as well,
13 and they'll be able to join us.

14 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. Thank you. So if I
15 may, it's a little bit after 11:30, and rather than
16 starting on the Heber Dunes report, I'd like to skip
17 ahead to Item 5(B), which is the Commission calendar.
18 And we can hit that before lunch, take a lunch, and
19 then come back and have a seamless presentation for
20 Heber Dunes. How does that sound?

21 **AGENDA ITEM V(B) - 2012 Commission Meeting Dates**

22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: So as you know, the statute
23 requires the Commission to have four meetings a year.
24 Obviously, this Commission, we've had more this year
25 than four. The goal would be to meet the Commission's

1 preference for what you would like for next year as we
2 look at the 2012 calendar. There has been some
3 discussion about whether or not you wanted to look at
4 having meetings on Saturdays or on the weekends or
5 nighttime. Those are all options. Sometimes budget
6 constraints get in our way. This year at one point in
7 time we weren't allowed to pay overtime. There are
8 some of those constraints, but certainly there has been
9 some discussion about how we get better attendance at
10 meetings. People aren't able to take time off work,
11 might appreciate trying to look at Saturdays or those
12 sort of things.

13 Commissioner Franklin did provide dates that he
14 was not available, so he wanted to make sure he got
15 those ahead of time. So I think as we look to
16 possibilities, and I'm always going to be an
17 optimistic, however, I will say that this year we're
18 looking at three terms of the Commissioners are due.
19 Let's see, the terms expire March 15th for three
20 Commissioners. The Governor has 60 days to reappoint.
21 If the Governor doesn't reappoint or make some other
22 appointment, in this case doesn't reappoint, then those
23 Commissioners would no longer serve on this Commission.
24 So there may be, in deference to you, consideration of
25 having a meeting before that March 15th date so that we

1 can get this Commission all together again. So I would
2 say perhaps look at dates prior to March 15th, and then
3 as you start to look at other possible dates that might
4 work for you.

5 So we had proposed a couple of dates in
6 February, late in the year sometime, if you are going
7 to look somewhere around the 24th and 25th, that was
8 something of interest. And then looking towards April,
9 if that was something, or May, if that was a
10 possibility, as well. Keeping in mind that the
11 scheduling is sometimes tough trying to give
12 consideration to those grant recipients. And so
13 they're preparing their grants, you want to try to not
14 have a meeting the week before the grants are due. So
15 we try to accommodate and provide you those dates in
16 this calendar so that you can look at it and how it
17 melds with your preference.

18 CHAIR LUEDER: Are we still dealing with
19 furlough Fridays?

20 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: No, at this point in time
21 furloughs are a thing of the past.

22 CHAIR LUEDER: Well, I see the preliminary grant
23 applications are due on March 5th, and 60-day clock
24 expires on March 15th, so to me it makes some sense to
25 have a meeting possibly on the 8th and 9th, or 9th and

1 10th. Does anybody have conflicts with that, but that
2 would be a suggestion.

3 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: I have a conflict on that
4 weekend.

5 COMMISSIONER KERR: What was the logic?
6 Wouldn't we want to potentially encourage grant
7 applications?

8 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Absolutely. We certainly
9 have no problem with getting grant recipients. There's
10 a larger demand --

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: If we do after the deadline,
12 then we're done for the year, unless they somehow have
13 a place in line.

14 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: What do you mean we're done
15 for the year?

16 COMMISSIONER KERR: Well, if there are any
17 grant-related initiatives that the Commission wants to
18 encourage, and we held the meeting after the grants,
19 the preliminary deadline -- preliminary submittal,
20 right?

21 CHAIR LUEDER: The preliminary submittal is on
22 March 5th, and my logic behind that was that some of
23 our attendees may be busy on their grant applications
24 prior to that, so --

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: What about the ones that

1 aren't busy and should be?

2 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: That's up to the Commission
3 as to what they would like, but I would certainly say
4 that we're going to start in January, the first grant
5 workshops that we do. So certainly if there's any
6 ideas that the Commission has that they'd like to share
7 with us, we certainly can share those at the Commission
8 workshops. And any sort of regulatory, when we're
9 looking at criteria that we may want to influence on
10 the grant program, that would need to be done, that
11 meeting we already had, where we solicited your input
12 for what you would like to see in the upcoming grant
13 program. So that's passed because we're already
14 through the Office of Administrative Law approval
15 period. That was some of the issues we talked about at
16 the last meeting with BLM and the acquisition with
17 Redding Field Office. So I think it is just up to you
18 guys what you would like.

19 CHAIR LUEDER: So possibly February 23rd, 24th.
20 I see Ridgecrest BLM has a steering committee meeting.

21 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We just put those on there
22 because Mr. Waldheim always gets them on there. We've
23 always solicited people if we have issues about the
24 calendar for the coming year, let us know. Again, I'll
25 reiterate that desire. If you've got meetings that you

1 would like for us to keep track of, we're happy to do
2 so. As you can tell, Mr. Waldheim makes sure he gets
3 all of the dates in there. That's really up to you.

4 CHAIR LUEDER: Would that be a meeting that
5 staff would be attending that would prevent us from
6 having enough staff?

7 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: No, it would prevent you
8 from having it.

9 CHAIR LUEDER: Any conflicts with 23, 24 of
10 February?

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: What about Daphne's
12 suggestion that we might want to consider starting
13 these meetings on a Friday and maybe have some public
14 comment on Friday night. I certainly would be open to
15 having the meetings on Fridays. Like right now, this
16 one you had on Wednesday and Thursday, which has got to
17 be the worst for people that are working, and so we had
18 difficulty getting a quorum here. A lot of public
19 hearings that I go to are in the evenings. People can
20 come. At some point the clock runs out, and everybody
21 goes home to bed.

22 CHAIR LUEDER: Certainly if we scheduled a
23 meeting for a Friday, we can certainly adjust the time
24 if there's a need to have that meeting roll over into
25 the evening to accommodate the public.

1 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'd like to at least voice
2 my opinion that I think it would be great if we had
3 these tours on Fridays during the day, and then if we
4 need to have -- if it's a lengthy agenda, we might
5 spill into Saturdays and potentially meet after going
6 out for the tour or meet on the following morning. And
7 I think you'd get better attendance. It would be
8 easier for people to work it into their schedules. It
9 would be easier for me.

10 CHAIR LUEDER: I'm more than happy to try that
11 style of meeting. So we could look at possibly the
12 25th as an additional day. So does anybody have a
13 conflict with that at this time? All right. Why don't
14 we tentatively schedule the 24th of February and 25th
15 for the first meeting of 2012?

16 COMMISSIONER KERR: I encourage Daphne to think
17 creatively about how we might expedite the Commission
18 meeting part of that by maybe have some nighttime
19 portion of it. I don't really have an opinion about
20 it, but I think there is probably a way to do it. She
21 can figure it out.

22 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Are we going to talk about
23 locations or need to be at a certain place in the
24 state?

25 CHAIR LUEDER: I think tentatively we'll talk

1 about locations kind of once we get a schedule down,
2 but I think we've always been flexible on locations
3 because certain things, like this General Plan, we
4 thought was going to be done six months ago, and it
5 took a little longer. So it's kind of hard sometimes
6 to nail down an exact location. But certainly during
7 the winter, we want to try and be in the desert
8 locations, and in the summer maybe be up in the
9 Northern California areas when that schedule allows us
10 to be.

11 Moving on looking forward a couple of months
12 into April and May, are there any suggestions at this
13 point from staff?

14 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: A possibility would be like
15 April 27, 28. Jawbone's grand opening is on the 28th.

16 CHAIR LUEDER: Anybody have any thoughts on
17 that? So that would be a 27th, 28th of April. I don't
18 hear any comments, so I'm going to say that's an
19 affirmative at this point, and we're okay. Let's block
20 out the 27th and 28th, and it appears that that could
21 be at Jawbone area meeting obviously.

22 When is the budget?

23 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We may have a conflict, and
24 we can talk off-line with the Jawbone because we do
25 have the Clay Pit General Plan, so that's something

1 that's looking at April for that, but we will talk
2 about that.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: The end of the fiscal year is
4 June 30th, correct?

5 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Correct.

6 CHAIR LUEDER: So what we could do is we could
7 have a meeting scheduled in June as an alternative date
8 if we need to have a date for Clay Pit. And also be
9 before the end of the fiscal year, so we wouldn't have
10 a fiscal constraint which we do occasionally have
11 during the summer.

12 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Okay.

13 COMMISSIONER KERR: Travel is on hold while the
14 budget battle looms on?

15 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: You never know. Right now
16 we are better off than we were six months ago
17 certainly, but we're better now than in the past.

18 CHAIR LUEDER: Why don't we look at June 14th
19 and 15th.

20 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: I have a conflict.

21 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Can look at June 8th or 9th
22 or 22nd and 23rd as you mentioned.

23 CHAIR LUEDER: I think 22 and 23 would better.
24 There's school graduations and whatnot earlier in the
25 month. So 22, 23, we will put that as a possible.

1 So that gets us into September generally.

2 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And if I may just say
3 October perhaps as you start to look at desert, it
4 might make more sense in September.

5 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. I was thinking that we
6 might try and schedule five meetings so that in case we
7 have to cancel one we can still have our four. And if
8 we didn't take the June date and waited all the way
9 until October, that would be a long dry spell. So I
10 was thinking maybe we could do a September and then
11 early November, if that works for people.

12 So looking at September maybe the 13th, 14th or
13 15th, anybody have any --

14 COMMISSIONER KERR: I think if you do it on
15 Fridays instead of Thursday, Friday.

16 CHAIR LUEDER: So 14th, 15th.

17 COMMISSIONER KERR: It's right after Labor Day.
18 This one came right after Thanksgiving.

19 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay.

20 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And that weekend I believe,
21 just so that you know, that's Sands Sports Super Show
22 is that weekend. So that factors in to where you might
23 want to have it.

24 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. And then looking at
25 November, maybe November 9th and 10th.

1 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Veteran's Day is observed
2 on the 12th. Another possibility may be the 2nd, 3rd.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: That might be a little close to
4 our September meeting. How about the 30th and 1st,
5 like we're doing now? I know it's a little bit of a
6 stretch, but.

7 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: I will say it was a
8 stretch. This one was hard.

9 CHAIR LUEDER: How about December 7th and 8th?

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: November 30th.

11 CHAIR LUEDER: We will do November 30th and
12 December 1st again. Who knows, we may be back here.
13 So we have five dates identified, and it looks like we
14 will be doing Saturdays. So we'll see how that works.
15 Any other discussions about locations?

16 COMMISSIONER KERR: Are we ever going to get up
17 north?

18 CHAIR LUEDER: How far up north do you want to
19 go?

20 COMMISSIONER KERR: Nice places around
21 Clear Lake. I personally like Elk Mountain. There's a
22 lot.

23 CHAIR LUEDER: Definitely, I recreate up there
24 often, I would be all in favor of that, as well as the
25 Shasta area. So we'll keep those as thoughts, and

1 we'll work with staff over the year.

2 COMMISSIONER KERR: I think the solar guys are
3 pretty much hands off up there.

4 CHAIR LUEDER: They do have some wind projects
5 on the books. So we will work with staff on locations
6 and also times of those meetings to work with the
7 public. So if there's no other comments on that.

8 First meeting would be February 24th and 25th.
9 Second meeting would be April 27th and 28th. Third
10 meeting would be June 22nd and 23rd. The fourth
11 meeting would be September 14th and 15th. And the
12 fifth meeting would be December 1st and November 30th.

13 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And the Clay Pit one, it's
14 a smaller park than Heber, so we could maybe look at
15 trying to do the tour in the morning and a meeting in
16 the afternoon, depending on if that would work with
17 people's schedule.

18 CHAIR LUEDER: Any other comments from
19 Commissioners? We do have opportunity for public
20 comment on this.

21 ED WALDHEIM: I would just love to make sure if
22 you can come to the April one. That would be an
23 absolutely fantastic area, and you can see what we've
24 done to manage the public lands in the Jawbone/Dove
25 Springs area and probably take you to the ghost town in

1 Randsburg, which would be a fun tour for the public to
2 participate on that. Plus the big grand opening, we
3 hope to have Mike Poole, and Abbey in there, and the
4 state director, everybody, who's who from the BLM to be
5 at this, plus all of the politicians. So hope to have
6 a big fun opportunity, love to have you there.

7 CHAIR LUEDER: Closing public comment, so do I
8 hear a motion to move the proposed dates for 2012 as
9 stated?

10 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: So moved.

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: Second.

12 CHAIR LUEDER: All in favor.

13 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

14 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. It passes.

15 And it is exactly 12:00 noon, so we will break
16 for lunch, and we will come back at one o'clock.

17 (Returned at 1:16 from lunch break starting at 12:00.)

18 **AGENDA ITEM V(B) - GENERAL PLAN - HEBER DUNES SVRA**

19 CHAIR LUEDER: Item 5(A) presentation on Heber
20 Dunes State Vehicular Recreation Area General Plan and
21 Final Environmental Impact Report.

22 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: Good afternoon,
23 Commissioners, Kirk Shea, Sector Superintendent for
24 Heber Dunes. Today we are here to discuss the General
25 Plan and EIR for Heber Dunes, and hopefully end with

1 its approval by this board. During today, we're going
2 to talk a little about Heber Dunes, its location, its
3 history, and what's going on there today. We'll go
4 over the General Plan process and the public
5 participation, how we came up with the documents you
6 see before you. The small one is the General Plan,
7 about 105 pages. The larger one is the EIR, which is
8 the CEQA documentation for it, and our final steps to
9 finish up this particular process.

10 So as many of you saw yesterday or know,
11 Heber Dunes is located in Imperial Valley. It's
12 approximately 340 acres. Most of our visitation comes
13 within 30 minutes of the park, family-oriented
14 facility. We're surrounded by agricultural lands and
15 Highway 7 borders the Caltrans land right next to us
16 which provides easy access for many visitors of the
17 park.

18 So one of the things that make Heber ideal is
19 that it is very close to its population which is mostly
20 in El Centro, and like I said, most of the visitors are
21 within 30 minutes, and that provides a prime spot where
22 people can go out where they're not having to deal with
23 a three- to four- to five-hour drive to get out to the
24 park and recreate.

25 At this point I'd like to bring up Supervisor

1 Ranger Vic Herrick, and he will go over the park as it
2 is today and provide you just a little bit more
3 history.

4 RANGER HERRICK: Vic Herrick, Supervising
5 Ranger, Heber Dunes SVRA. I have a very brief recap of
6 where we've been so we know how we got where we are and
7 perhaps the future, too. So I'd like to review just
8 briefly the history. Heber Dunes obviously is a
9 geological formation that has been there for a long
10 time, but it was a remaining patch of undeveloped
11 Imperial Valley. It was not economical to farm it, or
12 it would have been. It was a formidable challenge and
13 remains so today. I've asked farmers what they would
14 do with it. Anyways, so it's an ideal location for
15 parkland. It still has recreational value. And the
16 county apparently recognized that and started
17 developing it. When the county had it, it was six
18 parcels acquired in the '60s and '70s, and it was used
19 for a wide variety of recreation, but it had minimal
20 infrastructure and it became increasingly valued by the
21 off-road community. There were rumors that it might
22 disappear, might not be opened anymore, and the
23 Division, I understand, was very concerned with any
24 area being closed down. And we, we meaning DPR, seized
25 the opportunity to get into an agreement and to manage

1 it. Over time Heber Dunes became the off-road vehicle
2 park, and we actually have the title to it, we meaning
3 the DPR. Heber Dunes is often referred to by locals as
4 Heber Beach. So if you hear people say that, they
5 often correct me, oh, you mean Heber Beach, so.

6 In '98, the Division actually accepted Heber
7 Dunes, and it is now DPR's responsibility and the
8 Division's to manage it, as opposed to the county. The
9 county is generally speaking supportive of what we're
10 doing, and they are supportive by providing sheriff
11 backup for me and the Border Patrol also assists me.

12 When I first came to Heber, I was faced with
13 many challenges. This park, it needed TLC. It had
14 quite a few things that we found were unacceptable.
15 Large amounts of dumping of things like construction
16 debris. There was some pretty wild parties that led to
17 problems like vandalism and unplanned for fires,
18 accidents, EMS responses, various problems. So there
19 was clearly a need for us to take some action to clean
20 up the park, so to speak. We had other issues that
21 were not necessarily unlawful but might be determined
22 to be incompatible like commercial beekeeping. It's
23 disconcerting to have a bee go into your helmet. We
24 had hunting, a long-term thing, a lawful pursuit, but
25 not within the boundaries of the state park. And to

1 this very day, I meet people who say, oh, I've been
2 hunting here for years. I believe them, but I try to
3 offer them guidance on where they can go elsewhere.

4 We tried to come up with solutions to correct
5 some of the obvious problems, and I daresay most of
6 them have been pretty effective. And probably one of
7 the critical things was the decision to install gates.
8 Heber Dunes had been from my perspective plagued with
9 too many entrances, exits, or getaways. People could
10 just come in there 24/7, and they did. And there must
11 have been a dozen different ways to get in and out.

12 So by focusing the traffic at one major point of
13 entry and exit, this made enormously good sense and has
14 proven to be effective. It gave us some idea of who
15 was coming and going. We also have a nighttime
16 closure. Camping is not currently part of the Heber
17 Dunes experience. We're not necessarily against it,
18 but we're going to have to solve a few problems having
19 to do with logistics and staffing. We have fire pits.
20 You're required to have your fire in a designated area.
21 Heber Dunes is relatively small, much of the vegetation
22 at Heber Dunes will readily burn. So uncontrolled
23 fires were a problem. This has been a good solution.
24 Fires are okay, but not just anywhere.

25 We have signs. People need to reasonably know

1 where they are, know that it's not okay to hunt, for
2 example, and we've tried to inform the public by using
3 signs as well as personal contacts. We have dumpsters
4 and trash receptacles. It has been a challenge to get
5 compliance in terms of littering. I've had a very
6 substantial problem with littering at Heber Dunes.
7 We're working hard to try to solve it. Littering is
8 many things. It can be just an unattended picnic with
9 the wind and solves the problems for you, the paper
10 just blows away. It can mean burning pallets and
11 leaving 70 or 80 nails in the sand of which we have
12 harvested tens of thousands five-gallon buckets full to
13 try to solve it. So when you don't have a flat tire,
14 you can thank my volunteers who have picked up most of
15 those nails.

16 A superintendent has the ability to sort of
17 craft a rule that might be specific to a park to effect
18 a change, and a good example was requiring ATVs to have
19 a whip and flag. That's fairly consistent in my
20 experience with most of the off-road vehicle parks now,
21 and we have such a superintendent's order. We also
22 have one that prohibits the burning or even possession
23 of pallets for the reasons I just articulated because
24 of the litter that resulted from burning pallets.

25 Current uses are various and sundry, but

1 off-road vehicle recreation is certainly our primary
2 field of interest. We have the majority of our
3 visitors predictably during the cooler months of the
4 year. It is truly summertime at Heber. So most of our
5 folks come during the winter, and the busy weekends is
6 when you'll see most of us, especially on Sunday. It's
7 sort of family day in the Latino/Hispanic population,
8 which is representative of this community, and so
9 Sundays are especially busy days.

10 Our off-road pattern is primarily ATVs, it's
11 especially popular with ATVs. We have a few of
12 everything else, sand rails and super buggies and
13 motorcycles, but I would be willing to bet that roughly
14 80 percent of our user hours are on ATVs, possibly even
15 higher.

16 We have a few other uses there. We occasionally
17 see an equestrian. We occasionally see birds. Some of
18 us on the tour yesterday saw a Peregrine falcon. So we
19 have impressive bird and wildlife. It's often used as
20 a station area for others. It's also used as a
21 training facility. It's popular with the sheriff to
22 train their staff and popular with the Border Patrol.
23 As Daphne pointed out to us yesterday, this place is an
24 ideal training place. It offers safe but technical
25 challenges that you can use, and so that's recognized.

1 It's also used as a fishing access. I know better
2 places to fish. You give me a call if you need the
3 information.

4 One third of the park's visitors are young,
5 under 15, and we think that this suggests that it is a
6 very popular family place. Just a subjective
7 observation, I'm not as busy with enforcement actions
8 now as I was when I started. I think the user groups
9 maybe have changed a little bit, and that's reflected
10 not in my interest level but in my activity level. So
11 Heber, I believe, has an impressive safety record. And
12 having the presence of somebody there 24/7 has done a
13 great deal to enhance the favorable aspects of this
14 park. I'm beating around the bush. Having somebody
15 there watching the store is a helpful thing, and some
16 of the activities that occurred in the past that
17 weren't in the best interest have diminished. I'm
18 finished, unless there's questions.

19 CHAIR LUEDER: So you mentioned that one third
20 of your park's visitors are youth under 15. I would
21 imagine most of those are English speaking because they
22 are youth under 15. Is that a fair assumption?

23 RANGER HERRICK: I can neither affirm nor deny.
24 If I can give you just my personal, subjective
25 impression, I do not agree with your observation. I

1 think your sample group must be too small. There is a
2 huge number of people that speak primarily Spanish.
3 That was a great challenge to me. I'm not bilingual,
4 and at first I thought, oh, I'm really going to be in
5 trouble here, but I found there is almost always
6 somebody helpful that comes over and assists us. I
7 guess my point is there's a great many primarily
8 Spanish-speaking visitors, both Mexican nationals and
9 Mexican-Americans.

10 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. Would you say that
11 probably over 50 percent are Spanish speaking only or
12 is it hard to say?

13 RANGER HERRICK: I'm sorry, I really hesitate to
14 give you a percentage, a substantial number. It's
15 typical I'll be in a group, I start off with five
16 people, pretty soon I have 15 around me. And then I'll
17 say is there somebody that can help me with
18 translating, and a couple of people will volunteer. I
19 don't know if the silent ones choose not to volunteer
20 or if they only speak Spanish.

21 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. So part of what I was
22 trying to get to was just maybe I wasn't very observant
23 yesterday, that's possible, but I didn't see signage in
24 both languages, English and Spanish. And I'm just
25 wondering if that's a conscious choice or if that's

1 something that is in the works or if that would help.

2 DEPUTY SUPT. SHEA: That's the plan in the
3 future. We started that process of putting signage in
4 English and in Spanish. In general, the Department
5 policy is not to do that, so it's a little lengthy
6 process to get the waivers to go do that. And then the
7 other issues we have is that there's an official
8 translator for Spanish, and that doesn't always match
9 up with the local dialect. Although people speak
10 Spanish, it's a little bit different Spanish, so we
11 want to make sure that when we do that we use the local
12 dialects. Does that help? I want to say the
13 percentage, it's in the mid 80s, that's for the people
14 that speak Spanish. It's a very high percentage. I
15 don't know that we have a number for solely speaking
16 Spanish.

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: And I did notice yesterday
18 where the interpretive messaging is inside, a lot of
19 that was in Spanish. To some degree, it is that
20 balance. We need to communicate with our public, and
21 if our public is speaking Spanish, then we need to have
22 appropriate messaging.

23 DEPUTY SUPT. SHEA: One of the things, with the
24 interpreter Jamie Mendez, one of the things that we
25 impressed upon her and she'll begin in the future is

1 those interpretive programs will be English and
2 Spanish. So it will be more than just the written
3 literature, trying to do outreach as far as possible in
4 that language.

5 Now that we've seen a little bit about Heber and
6 where it's been, we'll delve into the General Plan and
7 EIR, the Environmental Impact Report. Those are the
8 documents that you will vote on today. With that, I'd
9 like to bring up Michael Page. He works with AECOM.
10 He can give you a little more of how we went through
11 the public process, more of the technical side of this.

12 MICHAEL PAGE: Thank you, Kirk. It's great to
13 be here today. This hopefully will be the end of a
14 great process for Heber Dunes, the first of several
15 general plans and environmental impact reports that
16 we're preparing for State Parks for OHMVR. As Kirk
17 mentioned, I'm Michael Page from AECOM and a principal
18 planner and project director for these efforts in
19 Southern California.

20 The discussion about the Spanish speakers was a
21 good kind of segue into this slide here. The top half
22 shows the General Plan process that we went through in
23 English with Spanish translation down below. And if
24 you go through the steps, you'll see that we had a fair
25 amount of public outreach and participation. All of

1 those programs were done both in English and Spanish.
2 When we did all of our fieldwork, we made sure that the
3 interviewers were fluent in both languages, as well.

4 So looking at the slide, we have way back to
5 step one, we really got underway in the spring of 2009
6 with the visitor surveys to find out what people liked
7 about the park, what they didn't like, what they
8 thought could be improved. And then with that moved to
9 step two where we performed resource evaluations for
10 biology, cultural resources, air quality, water
11 quality.

12 And once the issues were identified both from
13 the resource surveys and from the stakeholder
14 interviews and the outreach that we're doing, we
15 developed land use alternatives for the park, and you
16 saw the maps. I think we have some in the corner there
17 that we will put up a little bit later that show the
18 collective plan, but we went back out to the public
19 with various alternative plans that came up. That was
20 in the winter of 2009 when that was selected, the
21 preferred plan.

22 Once we had a preferred kind of conceptual land
23 use plan for the park, we then developed the actual
24 Draft General Plan. And that process, again, we put
25 out and get public comment on that. When we finally

1 had agreement on the General Plan, the first draft, we
2 went into the Environmental Impact Report process per
3 CEQA. And the General Plan and Draft EIR were
4 circulated, which is what you have before you to
5 consider today. And that brings us to the final step,
6 step eight, today where we're looking hopefully for
7 project approval.

8 So the next few slides will run through kind of
9 that eight-step process that's shown up on the board
10 there. Public participation process, we had fact
11 sheets and newsletters that went out to the public. We
12 had a lot of Internet postings, as well as e-mail
13 blasts that we hoped would kind of work as sort of a
14 chain mail, once it went out to a certain core group,
15 they would send it to their friends and pass it on. We
16 had interviews in the park as well as an on-line
17 questionnaire that could be done. Then we held public
18 workshops as well to invite the public out where it was
19 a lot like this, where we had boards and discussions.
20 But we would break out into groups, working tables and
21 bring out all of the Magic Markers and whatnot, and
22 that was all with Spanish translation, as well.

23 Here are the key planning issues, and we've
24 talked about these a lot on the tour and earlier today,
25 but quickly running through them, the park provides

1 unique recreation opportunity for the local community.
2 It's very much a local park. In terms of environmental
3 issues, air quality is a huge issue in Imperial County.
4 OHV is a very small part of that. There is a lot of
5 agriculture. For those of you here last night, you can
6 see there are high winds and dust storms that come up
7 from the high winds. You also heard people discuss the
8 economic-driven aspects of the park, the visitors and
9 the income it brings into the county, and that was also
10 a consideration for future acquisition to expand the
11 park when that's economically viable. There's
12 obviously promotion of responsible off-highway vehicle
13 recreation. The opportunity for interpretation and
14 education, both regarding OHV and natural resources and
15 agricultural, just interpreting the valley and
16 surrounding uses, as well.

17 We heard from the public that they might want
18 some additional way finding in the park. It's a small
19 park, but there's still the potential to kind of get
20 turned around out there and go into circles a little
21 bit, but you always have the SDG&E power towers there
22 to help you find the way. The important social value
23 of the park, final two points there, one is that you
24 saw the SDG&E towers and the IID irrigation canals.
25 They are two aspects that help define the park and form

1 boundaries way-finding points. They were there first,
2 but we also want to make sure that we don't lose
3 additional park ground to additional utilities, so want
4 to continue to work with IID and SDG&E to maintain
5 existing easements and prevent further encroachment.

6 And then finally it is surrounded by agriculture
7 in this entire desert valley, this remnant dune systems
8 with the creosote scrub, so there is a natural resource
9 in there to be preserved and protected as well as the
10 issue with the tamarisk salt cedar that we saw, which
11 is the nonnative plants.

12 Here are two of the alternatives that we looked
13 at prior to coming up with the one that you see on the
14 hardboard up there, on the right of the screen, which
15 was the ultimately-selected land use plan. And a
16 question came up yesterday about the acreages of those
17 zones, and we didn't calculate the acreages on those
18 because they're really not hard lines. Those are
19 really just kind of conceptual zone areas for the park.
20 And the point on doing that is that in the field there
21 can be more adaptive management and you can make the
22 hard lines when you're determining actual hard projects
23 out there.

24 That's just showing you the five sections that
25 went into the General Plan. All parks have to start

1 with the park vision, and this being an OHV park,
2 certainly that's the number one vision is to provide a
3 safe and enjoyable source of recreation for OHV. But
4 also as you heard a number of times, there's a lot more
5 than just the OHV recreation that goes on there.
6 There's the gathering of the families, and there's also
7 been discussion with Caltrans lands, the adjacent
8 lands, of the future expansion of the park into those
9 flatter less dune areas for possible special events and
10 tracks and other things that could take place.

11 The planning zones that we came up with were to
12 provide for all of the needs of the park and taking
13 into account the topography, the natural resources, the
14 physical boundaries with the property lines, and the
15 utilities. So running down in the order of kind of as
16 you encounter them from the north to the south, we have
17 the entrance zone would be first when you come into the
18 park. Right inside the entrance looking at the park
19 housing overlays provides for the rangers and support
20 staff; the activity zone, which you saw yesterday with
21 the training track that was put up there, and the
22 future activities that are plans for that area; the
23 welcome zone with the ranger station and interpretive
24 area. The Clay Pan Zone was kind of the high-speed
25 current flat open areas that we were looking at.

1 Eastern zone was the heavy tamarisk, and that requires
2 constant maintenance to keep that open for the OHV
3 recreation. The Dune Zone, which that's the native
4 habitat component of the creosote scrub and salt bush
5 as well, and that was actually done beyond the dunes in
6 the Resource Management Zone.

7 Just going through the process that we went
8 through for the Environmental Impact Report, which we
9 didn't begin until we had really finished coming up
10 with the General Plan, the notice of preparation
11 announcing to the public and agencies that we were
12 starting this process was in January of last year. We
13 completed the EIR in August of 2011, and public review
14 just ended last October, October 10, 2011.

15 In the Environmental Impact Report as I've
16 implied or stated, we're obviously looking at the
17 General Plan, which is a policy-level document, but
18 we're also looking at the near-term facility
19 improvements at a project level to make sure they can
20 be constructed as well, and those being the projects
21 within the next two years, and including the plans that
22 were shown yesterday for the picnicking area and
23 improvements by the ranger station.

24 I don't know how familiar you guys are with
25 environmental impact reports, but those are the topics

1 that we went over in detail. Being a planning-level
2 document and being a park that has been used for OHV
3 for a number of years and has a lot of nonnative
4 vegetation and whatnot, and because of all of the other
5 regulations that State Parks need to abide by in
6 managing and operating these facilities, we really
7 didn't come up with much in the way of environmental
8 impacts. The way the park is managed basically avoids
9 the impacts.

10 The only exception was in biological resources.
11 Although our biologists and previous biologists did not
12 observe active Burrowing owl burrows, Burrowing owls
13 have been observed in the park in the past, and they're
14 very prevalent in the surrounding agricultural areas.
15 So we did come up with a potential impacts to that with
16 a mitigation measure requiring consultation with the
17 Department of Fish and Game should a specific project
18 be proposed and then owl being discovered in that area.

19 Bringing us pretty much up to date, during the
20 public review period, we received five letters during
21 the review period, actually four plus the
22 clearinghouse. So the four were from the local
23 Imperial County Air Pollution Control District, who
24 we've been working with throughout the process. And
25 that was really documenting or continued dialogue on

1 the air quality issues and the importance of air
2 quality in Imperial County. Imperial Irrigation
3 District commented. Again, we've been in touch with
4 them through the process, and they were restating that
5 they own the canals and facilities adjacent to the park
6 and that they need to retain access to those facilities
7 pretty much at all times. And should there be any
8 modifications to IID facilities, that State Parks would
9 be the ones that would have to pick up the tab for
10 that, if it were related to the SVRA. Colorado River
11 Board, fairly standard letter stating the importance of
12 water quality issues in the valley and protecting
13 those. And a statement from the Department of Toxic
14 Substances Control, neither of those had really
15 specific comments on the park itself, more general
16 policies that the State Parks should be aware of. And
17 then finally State Clearinghouse just confirmed that
18 the agencies they submitted the report to and who had
19 commented. Then we did receive a late letter from the
20 California Department of Fish and Game, and they
21 mentioned the Burrowing owl and other issues to keep in
22 mind during future projects but were not real specific
23 on the General Plan itself.

24 So the big thick document which you've all seen
25 was the Draft Environmental Impact Report that went out

1 for public review. The Final Environmental Impact
2 Report is just that draft document along with all of
3 the letters received during public review, the
4 responses to those letters, which you should have in
5 your package. And then we prepared an errata sheet to
6 go with those documents making minor corrections to the
7 document based on our responses to the public review.
8 And in future electronic and hard copy versions, we'll
9 actually make those text revisions to the document.

10 And then the actions before you today really and
11 yesterday was first starting with the site visit and
12 tour. Then today's hearing, we're asking that you
13 approve the General Plan, but first you need to certify
14 the EIR and the mitigation monitoring reporting
15 program, which has the one mitigation measure for the
16 Burrowing owls, and the findings of fact stating that
17 all potential impacts were considered and were avoided,
18 reduced, or mitigated for.

19 And with that, if everything goes smoothly
20 today, the staff will be filing a Notice of
21 Determination with the State Clearinghouse and the
22 county clerk. That starts the 30-day statute of
23 limitations on the Environmental Impact Report. And
24 once that 30-day period passes, if there are no
25 challenges, then the CEQA process is complete, and we

1 would be done on this portion of the General Plan. So
2 that concludes my presentation. We're available for
3 questions.

4 CHAIR LUEDER: Yes, we have a couple of
5 questions. Commissioner Silverberg.

6 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Thanks, Michael, for
7 going over that. You said that there really weren't
8 any environmental impact issues that were going on,
9 just the way the park is being managed, correct?

10 MICHAEL PAGE: Correct.

11 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: In the EIR, did it
12 mention anything about how to handle any dust issues or
13 if there are any?

14 MICHAEL PAGE: We actually -- we have our air
15 quality specialist with us today, Bill Maddux, and I'll
16 have Bill come up to give you the technical answer.

17 But the nontechnical answer is that State Parks
18 has been working with the Air Quality Control Board and
19 they're working on a dust control plan which would
20 involve basically documenting a number of things that
21 are already being done, which is putting down gravel or
22 pavement on main access roads, some watering of
23 high-use areas, and preserving vegetation within the
24 park to hold the dunes in place to catch the blowing
25 sand and dust.

1 BILL MADDUX: Bill Maddux, AECOM noise and air
2 quality specialist. Basically the way that the
3 Imperial County, Imperial Valley dust works is if you
4 don't have vegetation holding it down, it's already
5 blowing around, it's already in the air. But basically
6 the way that the Imperial County District has done
7 their dust control plan for the EPA, which is the
8 primary agency in all of this issue, they're the ones
9 that set the standards and determine we're in a
10 non-attainment area here.

11 And basically OHV activity on an existing OHV
12 park is not generating substantially more dust than is
13 being generated by windblown sand, by just a lack of
14 vegetation, and that's the standard wind erosion that's
15 happening throughout the valley that's being blown from
16 the agricultural farms onto the park and across the
17 other farms, as well.

18 Basically the way that they calculate it is
19 based on acreage. You've got this much acreage, you've
20 got this much activity, you're going to be having
21 activity in that area, you're going to disturb the
22 area, you're going to generate a certain amount of dust
23 by just disturbance.

24 So the General Plan increase of use or the
25 proposed uses aren't really increasing the dust

1 generation from the park. It's already a standard
2 situation there. It's been dealt with, as Michael
3 indicated, through standard management practices,
4 through control measures that the EPA has identified
5 and provided to State Parks and tried to implement, big
6 things like putting down the gravel. There's not a
7 whole lot that can be done. And honestly OHV are not a
8 serious issue in the air quality for the district.

9 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: It's not really an
10 issue?

11 BILL MADDUX: It seems to be an issue because
12 you can see the rooster tail kick up from it, but if
13 you go out there later on today, you know, the whole
14 basin will be just dark with dust from the wind. So
15 it's really not an issue. And especially for a park of
16 this size, this park compared to BLM lands or other
17 state park lands that have much greater potential for
18 dust. But even that, I think all of OHV was maybe five
19 percent of the entire dust generation within the valley
20 based on the EPA and Air District's calculations.

21 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: That includes Imperial
22 Sand Dunes and all of the rest?

23 BILL MADDUX: Yes, sir. Basically agriculture
24 is the issue.

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: They broke the crust.

1 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: First of all, I want to
2 commend AECOM and staff for doing what looks to be a
3 very, very thorough job. I mean this EIR, especially
4 for such a small area, I would hate to see what the
5 Ocotillo Wells EIR will look like. It will be multiple
6 volumes, I'm sure. But, again, a very thorough
7 comprehensive job, good body of work.

8 I'm just curious what's next once we approve the
9 General Plan. And what if we didn't approve the
10 General Plan? I mean is that even an option? What if
11 we decided not to approve it? What would that mean?

12 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: I'll answer a little bit.
13 Phil or Daphne can jump in on this one. Not approving
14 the General Plan really limits on how much we can do in
15 the park. If you notice when we were there yesterday,
16 there were almost no permanent structures. Everything
17 is temporary. We need the General Plan to put some
18 permanency in there, to provide facilities and
19 infrastructure not only to the staff but to support the
20 park and also the visitors. And we need the General
21 Plan to do that. We can't expand the park in the
22 future also without that guidance because the General
23 Plan gives us that broad general management direction
24 that we need to go.

25 From here what we can do is start to do some of

1 the more defined, closer-focused plans, like we can go
2 into a trail management plan, and we can start
3 monitoring and make those types of decisions on how
4 we're best going to manage.

5 CHIEF JENKINS: If there were anything that you
6 considered a serious flaw in the plan, then he would
7 send that back to us, and then we would go back, work
8 with staff, correct whatever flaws you felt like were
9 in the plan, address those issues. That would cause a
10 recirculation of the EIR, I suspect if it was
11 significant enough, if it changed that. So it would
12 depend on the level of significance what we were
13 changing, how long it would take to turn it around and
14 bring it back to you for a future date.

15 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: I just wanted to add one
16 thing real quick. Speaking not from the technical
17 terms, but speaking from my heart, we're here today,
18 you guys are here today as members of the Commission
19 who have an opportunity to help State Parks be able to
20 manage an area effectively for the riders for the
21 resources for years to come. We've talked about that
22 this plan is good for 20 years. We know that often
23 they last 30 or 40 years in State Parks, and we also
24 know that managed recreation is very effective. We
25 know that unmanaged recreation can be very ineffective,

1 not good for the people, not good for the resources.
2 And we have an opportunity today to make sure that
3 we're able to have strategies and things in place that
4 help guide that management so that we're not doing
5 unmanaged recreation anywhere. Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: In reading through this,
7 there's a number of planned improvements or
8 infrastructure-wise that are contemplated within the
9 plan. One thing that I kept looking for and didn't see
10 was sort of what's important. What is the
11 prioritization? There was no prioritization of, yeah,
12 let's do this versus let's do that. And in an
13 environment where funding is so hard to come by, how
14 does the manager of the SVRA decide on what to do when?

15 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: Excellent question. And
16 that changes sometimes from year to year depending on
17 that funding and the opportunities that arise. And the
18 other thing is the state process, sometimes those
19 processes can take four or five years, and sometimes
20 they can be done right away. So it really depends on
21 the project in particular. We didn't go ahead and
22 prioritize projects in that document again because it's
23 more broad based. It provides basic guidance so we can
24 go into the more detailed strategies afterwards.

25 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I kind of have a follow-up

1 question I guess on the same line. So the near-term
2 projects that are described in the plan, if we approve
3 this plan in the EIR, what's the first thing -- it's
4 kind of what Gary was saying -- what's the timeline?
5 Are we looking at something two or three years out like
6 he said? Is there funding available that State Parks
7 has already in the bank that we can start moving on
8 some of these things?

9 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: There was a project that
10 went parallel with the General Plan in the anticipation
11 of it being approved, so some of those improvements
12 that you see in the documents would be probably
13 completed within a year or two. Because those
14 processes take four and five years sometimes, rather
15 than wait for the funds to be approved and then wait
16 another five years to go through the process to get
17 them done, they ran parallel this time. Does that
18 answer your question?

19 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Yes, I think so.

20 And follow-up question to that would be the
21 youth track that's there right now, the practice track,
22 what's the status of that with the formalization of
23 this plan? I mean you're calling it temporary. Does
24 that just change terminology and say it's permanent?

25 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: No, once the General Plan is

1 approved and then we can start looking at some of the
2 permanent projects, and we can finalize and really peg
3 things into place, we can look at, A, is that the best
4 home based on what we know now. Are we going to put
5 more on it? Are we going to make it larger? Are we
6 going to make it smaller? No, it's not just changing
7 the name and calling it permanent. There is a little
8 more to it. But there will be a youth track there.
9 We've seen an obvious need for it, and we've actually
10 seen the need probably for additional not a youth track
11 but a training track. We don't want to see the 500 cc
12 bike training next to the 70 cc quad. We need to give
13 the adults a place to train and learn, as well.

14 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: It looks like those posts
15 are pretty well planted in the ground.

16 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: You would be surprised at
17 how quickly they come up. It took them about, I
18 believe, a week to put in during the summer. That
19 whole track could be pulled up in a day, and we can
20 grade it out, and it would look like it was never there
21 in under two days. So it really is temporary.

22 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Part of really what our
23 team has done, it's sort of a two-team effort in the
24 sense of a two tiers in the sense one team is working
25 on the General Plan, the other team, as Kathy

1 indicated, it takes five years for us from the time we
2 start a major cap outlay project to fruition or to
3 actually start construction. It's a five-year process.
4 So we started moving both at the same time.

5 If you were to approve this General Plan, it
6 would give us the ability to put the contract out to
7 bid in December for the near-term infrastructure,
8 near-term facilities that you saw. And so we'll
9 describe those, I think you guys have the board there,
10 and then be able to go out for contract for
11 construction in March. So I was very pleased by the
12 team's effort to be able to identify both of those and
13 try to work with them so that we can get them sort of
14 in a parallel process and not be typical government and
15 wait forever.

16 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: One more comment,
17 acquisition, potential acquisition to the east across
18 the canal, I would say something we would want to do
19 sooner than later, given the status of land sales and
20 everything else.

21 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: I would agree with you, and
22 the approving of the General Plan would allow us to go
23 forward and actually begin formal discussions to do
24 that, but we can't do that until the General Plan is
25 approved.

1 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: So you anticipate if this
2 thing is all approved, you'll start moving on the
3 acquisition project?

4 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: We can start the formal
5 discussions to do that, yes. We've had kind of
6 informal, and everyone says it seems like a decent
7 idea.

8 COMMISSIONER KERR: So I'd like, if it's
9 possible -- I don't want to describe this process as a
10 rubber stamp, I think this is a very well researched
11 and documented CEQA. I'm not suggesting that I have a
12 lot of comments about it. However, I think that it's
13 appropriate for this Commission to provide direction or
14 discussion about this priority thing. Let's assume for
15 the moment that we're going to approve this General
16 Plan. That essentially allows you a lot of flexibility
17 to do a number of things. So my question is:

18 What are those things and how are we going to do
19 it? So I understand that this project over here is
20 like a \$5 million project or something, Daphne. You
21 indicated you were interested in putting an RFP out is
22 what it sounded like. Has the money already been
23 budgeted for that?

24 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: The money would have had to
25 have gone through the process three years ago. The

1 first year is preliminary plans. And then the second
2 year is construction drawings, working drawings. The
3 third year is construction. The expectation is that it
4 takes five years from the start of the whole process to
5 completion.

6 COMMISSIONER KERR: Where are we in that
7 process?

8 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: We have construction
9 drawings.

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: And we have money allocated?

11 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: That's correct. The
12 Legislature allocated the money three years ago.

13 COMMISSIONER KERR: With regard to the potential
14 purchase from Caltrans, has that funding source been
15 identified?

16 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Different funding source,
17 but, yes, it has been identified, and that is something
18 that we actually will move on with Caltrans.

19 Just a little bit of a clarification, I don't
20 believe, Kirk, that we actually have to have the
21 General Plan approved in order to start those
22 discussions. Again, the General Plan is looking for
23 the hardscape versus being able to talk with Caltrans
24 about the possibility of acquiring that property.
25 Certainly that's a high priority.

1 COMMISSIONER KERR: You've already done the
2 construction drawings on the site development plan,
3 like I assume you have to get permits for this?

4 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Correct.

5 COMMISSIONER KERR: You must have gotten land
6 use entitlements already?

7 ATTORNEY LA FRANCHI: State Parks is a public
8 agency. They don't need local permits for --

9 COMMISSIONER KERR: So there's this issue and I
10 wanted to see if there is anybody else wanted to talk
11 about, where are you going to put the motor homes? So
12 there is obviously an opportunity to have more camping
13 and people come visit and stay for a while at this
14 facility. And so there's two areas I believe under
15 discussion. One is sort of right near the entrance to
16 the current park, which is a limited area, and then
17 there's a potential to expand the boundaries of the
18 park and have something more ambitious.

19 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Correct. One of the things
20 that we reflected on yesterday was that right now Heber
21 is really that urban park that meets a demand. We
22 don't have a huge demand for camping. Superintendent
23 Dolinar yesterday reflected upon the fact that you're
24 not going to find the people who are visiting Heber
25 Dunes don't have the financial ability to purchase a

1 motor home. We heard from other folks yesterday that
2 maybe people would want to start camping along the way,
3 maybe start looking at some of the retirement people
4 coming to head south for the season. So I think that
5 all of those are important.

6 I think in terms of the prioritization, it is
7 safety, and we saw that large landscape where you can
8 get up a lot of speed, and those are some of the issues
9 that Vic spoke about. So I think that we've identified
10 where those priorities are is how do we try to bring
11 people together, and how do we try and get them the
12 messaging, how do we try to make sure that we provide
13 places where you've got a whole family that comes and
14 you may have a family of ten, but you may only have two
15 OHVs, so the rest of them is sitting throughout the
16 day. That's what we've attempted to really do in
17 there, is meet those needs for the picnicking and that
18 sort of thing.

19 CHIEF JENKINS: Perhaps more specifically to
20 your question, after you do a General Plan, a lot of
21 the very specific work is in pullout plans after that.
22 So generally after a General Plan is done, we'll do
23 like a trails plan and circulation plan and a road
24 plan, like that. If in the future we think that
25 camping is becoming a need that needs to be addressed,

1 then we would do a specific plan to address the camping
2 issues and figure out --

3 COMMISSIONER KERR: You've got the money for the
4 new system and all that set aside. And that's part of
5 this, obviously got to happen pretty quick.

6 CHIEF JENKINS: Yes.

7 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Couple of things, I think
8 if you had a sign on Interstate 8, I think you would
9 have a lot more people coming down the road there.

10 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: There is actually a little
11 bit of history to that. When the signs were going up,
12 Caltrans allowed us one sign. So we had to be a little
13 judicious on where we placed that sign and that's where
14 it is. My plan in the next year or two is to go back
15 to Caltrans and ask if we can have another one.

16 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: That would be a great
17 asset. The other thing is I didn't see anything about
18 energy conservation, renewable energy like we're doing
19 at Prairie City, that kind of thing.

20 SECTOR SUPT. SHEA: As far as like solar or wind
21 towers? The project there, if the new building is
22 installed, solar panels are slated for that assuming
23 it's within the budget. So there is some renewable
24 energy planned into that.

25 MICHAEL PAGE: There is a section in the General

1 Plan that talks about conservation measures and future
2 design and development including LEED certification for
3 buildings within the park. And I believe it also
4 mentions solar energy, but it's not a whole chapter or
5 anything.

6 CHAIR LUEDER: Any other comments?

7 COMMISSIONER KERR: LEED certification doesn't
8 just happen. You would have to involve that in the
9 process.

10 CHIEF JENKINS: It's one of the things that
11 we've been working with our service center for all of
12 the buildings that we're developing. We've asked them,
13 as we move forward, to attempt to get LEED
14 certification on all of the buildings that we
15 construct, so they're building that into the process.
16 It's one of those where you're balancing how much is
17 that going to cost versus how much project you need to
18 do. So they're certainly evaluating their ability to
19 get LEED certification on the shop building and office
20 structure they're putting in.

21 COMMISSIONER KERR: But you're doing it in
22 March. Are you doing it or not?

23 CHIEF JENKINS: The plans they have right now,
24 the way I understand it, do have LEED certification.

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: You have budgeted a LEED

1 consultant and all that?

2 CHIEF JENKINS: Yes.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. I think for now we'll
4 conclude with that and open it up for public comment.
5 Thank you, Kirk.

6 ED WALDHEIM: I was a commissioner when we
7 started working on this Heber Dunes, remember that
8 Bob Hamm. And we had to make a decision, are we going
9 to do this baby or we're not going to do this. Is it
10 going to disappear or not disappear. I'm really proud
11 to see that you've come to this point to move forward,
12 and I hope you certify the plan, and you give the green
13 light to go ahead, especially in-lieu of the way the
14 Sacramento Legislature steals our money. Let's use it
15 before we lose it.

16 My biggest complaint is that there's so many
17 projects that we have that need to be done, like the
18 education program and things like that. We have the
19 money and yet we let them steal the money and we don't
20 spend it. Folks, spend the money because it's there,
21 and it keeps coming in. If you don't do it, Sacramento
22 will take it away from you.

23 JOHN STEWART: John Stewart, California
24 Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs. Listening to this,
25 I hear that you have money in the budget, by all means

1 I would encourage you to approve the plan, move
2 forward, spend that money in the budget before it is
3 lost. This is something that will benefit the
4 community, and it will be a model for projects similar
5 to this as State Parks moves forward. So, yes, I
6 encourage you to go ahead and approve the project, and
7 let's get it moving.

8 JIM BRAMHAM: And, likewise, in 1998 I was on
9 the OHV Commission, and this issue came up, and that
10 was, what, three deputy directors ago, and I can't tell
11 you how much I appreciate Daphne having stuck with this
12 process through the years, and that this is the
13 culmination of what is truly a project that had a
14 vision to it that had to be formulated and obviously
15 codified into this plan. And having reviewed it, I'm
16 just really impressed yesterday with the tour and
17 thanks again for doing that. But I would definitely
18 encourage you to approve this. Let's get this moving
19 forward. It's a huge asset to the community. And,
20 Paul, you and I have worked for years trying to figure
21 out urban parks, and this is exactly what you've tried
22 to do for years. So I would encourage you to approve.
23 Thank you.

24 CHAIR LUEDER: I think that concludes the public
25 comment. I'll bring it back to the Commission. Before

1 I do that, are there any other questions or comments on
2 air quality? I understand our consultant needs to
3 leave. You're free to go, if you'd like.

4 Bring it back to the Commission, and
5 Commissioner Willard.

6 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: Okay. I would like to
7 make a motion to certify the EIR and adopt a General
8 Plan. And I'm not quite sure the best way to do that.
9 I'm looking at Attachment D. Can I cite Attachment D
10 as the formal resolution of the Commission as part of
11 the motion?

12 ATTORNEY LA FRANCHI: That would be our
13 suggestion. That's why we tried to provide you with a
14 resolution. Your motion could be to adopt the
15 resolution as stated, if that's your preference, and
16 get a second, and then do the vote. If there are some
17 changes to that resolution that somebody wants to add
18 in, that could be done also, but that was our idea.

19 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: Okay. Then I would like
20 to make a formal motion to certify the Environmental
21 Impact Report and General Plan for Heber Dunes and
22 specifically as detailed in Attachment D of our
23 Commission meeting binder.

24 CHAIR LUEDER: Do I have a second on that?

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'll second it.

1 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Still looking for
2 Attachment D.

3 COMMISSIONER KERR: If I could, pretty much
4 since this thing is really on paper, maybe you can
5 really put those solar panels on there.

6 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Absolutely. Just part of
7 the history, I actually was reflecting on when we
8 approved the Hollister General Plan in 2001, the
9 Commission at that point in time said that they would
10 like if possible a solar component on any future
11 buildings being built. So in 2001 that was looking
12 forward.

13 COMMISSIONER KERR: I saw you got the solar hot
14 water.

15 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: However, that being said,
16 as it goes through the process, one of the control
17 agencies will review each project, at which time the
18 solar component may be deleted. However the Division
19 is committed to the use of solar when appropriate and
20 recognizes the importance of solar energy.

21 For clarification purposes, counsellor, I think
22 you have it in the resolution, but we need to be clear
23 about it. I think the proper language, as the
24 resolution says, is the certification of the EIR, the
25 adoption of the MMRP, the adoption of the CEQA findings

1 of fact, and the approval of the General Plan. We sort
2 of have to go in that order given that it's a CEQA
3 project.

4 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: As the maker of the
5 motion, I so amend my motion.

6 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: Is that verbatim on that
7 slide that Michael showed at the beginning of his
8 presentation?

9 ATTORNEY LA FRANCHI: I think that if you just
10 adopt the resolution, the proper language has been
11 crafted. We've vetted it with other attorneys in the
12 department to be consistent with the other side of the
13 department. So I think if you just adopt the language
14 that's in here, that would do the job. I don't think
15 you need to massage it in any finer tuning.

16 CHAIR LUEDER: All right. So I heard a motion
17 and a second from Commissioner Kerr. No further
18 discussion, call for the vote. All in favor?

19 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

20 CHAIR LUEDER: All opposed? Hearing none, the
21 motion carries. So we have approved the General Plan
22 and certified the EIR along with other associated
23 documents.

24 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: On behalf of everybody from
25 the Ocotillo Wells District and OHMVR Division, good

1 job, you guys. (Applause.)

2 CHAIR LUEDER: That concludes Item 5(A), so
3 we're going to move on to our last item of the day,
4 5(C), which will be a brief presentation to the
5 Commission on examples of public/private partnerships
6 within the OHMVR program. And before we do that, why
7 don't we take a ten-minute break. Thank you.

8 (Returned at 2:29 from a break starting at 2:16.)

9 **AGENDA ITEM V(C) - OHMVR Public/Private**
10 **Partnerships**

11 CHAIR LUEDER: Ready for Item C. We have a
12 presentation from staff on that.

13 CHIEF JENKINS: Very brief. So this is on
14 public/private partnerships. From what I understand
15 essentially I was just going to give a brief outline of
16 some of the mechanisms that we have currently where
17 we're using partnerships, and then we can discuss it
18 from there or perhaps take it up at a future meeting in
19 more detail.

20 There are several examples throughout the
21 Division State Parks where we as a Division are
22 partners with the private sector. The major ways those
23 are done, most obviously is concession operations where
24 we have a concessionaire come in, do some sort of
25 project in the park. Oftentimes that can include

1 construction activities. So, for instance, right now
2 we are working on a project at Oceano Dunes, actually
3 the state beach portion of it, where we've gone into a
4 Joint Powers Agreement with the city, and then the city
5 subsequently is working on building a lodge and
6 conference center, and that's being concessioned out
7 then to an entity that would run it for 50 years to
8 recoup the cost of construction. At the end of that
9 time, we would do a subsequent concession with whoever
10 wants to run it.

11 Also, another example of the big concession
12 operations, of course, when we were at Oceano Dunes is
13 the ATV operations. Those are all private partners
14 that are supplying the service where we didn't have the
15 wherewithal or it was just not practical for us to do
16 that as a state, so we concession that out. A couple
17 of examples, Hangtown track, by the way, is a third one
18 where not during the Hangtown race itself, but the rest
19 of the year, the track is a private concession. And so
20 folks come in, pay the concessionaire to use the track,
21 that concessionaire then does all of the track
22 maintenance and operates that, which is then different
23 from Hollister Hills where we do maintain all of our
24 tracks ourselves. And then when people want to come in
25 and use those, they're done through special events.

1 So special events is another category where you
2 have the public/private partnerships. You can have
3 for-profit outfits come in and do special events. Some
4 of those can be very large and quite lucrative for
5 State Parks. For instance, during the Concours
6 d'Elegance, the big car show that happens in the
7 Monterey peninsula, if you've ever been down by
8 Fisherman's Wharf, they'll do a big car auction down at
9 the conference center, and they'll do a display of all
10 of the vehicles out on State Park property out on the
11 plaza there. It was the last job I had before I became
12 to be Division Chief here, by the way, was running that
13 district. And that big event was always the highlight
14 of the year. And so the state then just takes a
15 percentage of those operations, and that percentage
16 varies depending on the arrangement they make with
17 whatever private entity is doing that.

18 Also, nonprofits will do those special events.
19 One example that's been very successful for us on that
20 for a series of special events is at Prairie City where
21 the mountain bikers come in and do races throughout
22 mainly the spring when they're doing it mostly. That
23 park, you may recall, is only opened six days a week.
24 It's closed on Wednesdays. And so on Wednesdays, the
25 mountain bike clubs come in. They do their races all

1 over the park. That way they have the park pretty much
2 to themselves. The promoter for those events charges
3 the participants an entry free to do the event and then
4 pays State Parks. And we get 100 percent cost recovery
5 out of those, by the way. So if we have staff on duty
6 to take care of medicals and whatnot, the promoter pays
7 our staff or pays us, we pay our staff, so that we are
8 reimbursed for that, so there is no charge to the OHV
9 Trust Fund.

10 Concession special events, cooperating
11 associations is another big partnership opportunity
12 that's used throughout the department. Cooperating
13 associations, when I say that, I'm describing places
14 like the Hollister Hills Off-Road Association and then
15 Ocotillo Wells, as Kathy was mentioning earlier, a new
16 association. Those associations typically are raising
17 money typically to be used in the park for
18 interpretation, buying equipment, helping with those
19 sorts of activities. There are some larger
20 associations throughout the state that get very
21 involved in larger projects. When I was at Point Lobos
22 before I came over to OHV this last time, that
23 association had quite a large amount of money
24 available. They had a number of people that would
25 bequeath their estates to the association to be used at

1 Point Lobos, kept their funds available for that. It
2 gets a little dicey sometimes trying to figure out how
3 to get the money from the association through the state
4 system and used in the park because there's a lot of
5 controls about capital outlay and parks. It's not
6 impossible, just one of those things you have to work
7 carefully with to get around.

8 And then there's, of course, foundations and
9 land trusts that are independent but do work with State
10 Parks a lot. So Trust for Public Lands works with
11 State Parks a lot. Save the Redwoods League buys land
12 and then holds it for the state, Big Sur Land Trust.
13 You can go on and on with these land trusts because the
14 state process to acquire land is so time consuming,
15 usually when we start a project and we get the money,
16 and we get it for three years. And then after three
17 years, you have trouble holding on to it. You have to
18 get it reappropriated or it reverts. A lot of these
19 acquisition projects take more than three years by the
20 time you do all of the required documentation and
21 whatnot. So --

22 COMMISSIONER KERR: This is what I wanted to
23 focus on, I apologize to you.

24 So with regards to say not only public/private
25 but public/public partnerships, first of all, it's my

1 understanding there's really no possibility of us
2 getting money for land acquisition over the next couple
3 of years.

4 CHIEF JENKINS: I wouldn't say there is no
5 possibility.

6 COMMISSIONER KERR: Is there any money in the
7 bank for land acquisition that's been appropriated that
8 the clock is running on right now?

9 CHIEF JENKINS: We have right now some money
10 setting available to us for opportunity purchase. So
11 if we had some opportunities pop up for -- typically
12 that's end-holding properties. So, for instance, at
13 Ocotillo Wells, there's a lot of little private end
14 holdings completely surrounded by State Parks. We have
15 a few million dollars in the bank, that's been
16 allocated to us that we have available so when those
17 properties become available, we can go out and purchase
18 them.

19 COMMISSIONER KERR: Is there a time limit on
20 that? You mentioned three years.

21 CHIEF JENKINS: Those, we get the money, and
22 then if we don't use it in three years, it reverts or
23 else we can ask for the money to be reappropriated.
24 You can get it for another chunk of time. Eventually,
25 if you don't use that money, it goes back into the

1 Trust Fund, and then you have to ask in a subsequent
2 budget for them to appropriate it again.

3 COMMISSIONER KERR: And would that be a better
4 way to acquire properties than to work with a local
5 jurisdiction and have them apply for a grant?

6 CHIEF JENKINS: We can work with local agencies
7 to apply for grants if they plan on operating the
8 property. I don't know, Tim, you might know on this
9 one, but if, for instance, if we asked a county to put
10 in for a grant to buy a piece of property to give to
11 us, that might not go over so big because it's
12 essentially granting the money to ourselves.

13 We are looking, based on some of the
14 conversations we've had at past meetings with the
15 Commission, at a way to make it so the counties that
16 want to run these smaller units will have a better
17 chance of getting grants from us for small parts that
18 they plan to run. So we want to encourage that and do
19 more of that.

20 For us to buy the property, really the most
21 efficient answer is for us to develop a relationship
22 with or for there to be created a land trust that would
23 work closely with us that would buy and hold the land
24 while we go through the process to get funding and so
25 forth.

1 COMMISSIONER KERR: Do you have any examples of
2 where we are doing that?

3 CHIEF JENKINS: There's examples of where it's
4 happened in the past. For instance, Truckhaven
5 property was purchased by the Trust for Public Land, I
6 think originally. And then they held it for a number
7 of years until our money became available, and then we
8 ended up transferring the money to the Trust for Public
9 Lands, and then we got title to the property. So
10 that's a successful example from the past where it's
11 happened.

12 ATTORNEY LA FRANCHI: Actually, Trust for Public
13 Land I think acquired an option and held the option.
14 Typically, the way they prefer to operate is to hold an
15 option so that they don't tie up their capital for long
16 periods of time if they don't have to. In that
17 situation and the ones I've seen, usually they'll get
18 an option, they'll go out and negotiate the option, and
19 then State Parks will get the appropriation for the
20 acquisition.

21 COMMISSIONER KERR: Just to speed this along, so
22 I don't know if there are any more questions about
23 acquiring property, I wanted to explore this a little
24 bit.

25 So let's talk about holding events. So you have

1 the Hangtown event. Unfortunately, that doesn't really
2 contribute that much to the -- I mean it's a wonderful
3 event. I understand it supports a number of local
4 charities in the Sacramento area, but it doesn't really
5 do that much for the SVRA. Would that be accurate?

6 CHIEF JENKINS: The event itself doesn't. The
7 club has done a lot for us in the past, so it's been a
8 very strong relationship with the club. It's not a big
9 cash event for the park, no.

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: Could it have been or could
11 a similar event say at a Hollister or other place have
12 a positive impact on our finances at a particular SVRA?

13 CHIEF JENKINS: Absolutely, depending on whoever
14 was arranging the event and holding it. When we did
15 the special event permit, we could ask them to pay us
16 whatever percentage we felt was appropriate. That
17 becomes a question of how far do you go with recovering
18 costs or getting --

19 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'm not talking about cost
20 recovery. I'm talking about having some money left
21 over that gets spent on the park that didn't have to
22 come out of the state budget.

23 CHIEF JENKINS: I shouldn't say cost recovery
24 because that really means cost recovery in a lot of
25 other ways. I meant like let's say you have a club

1 that wants to put on an event. So if they're going to
2 give money to the park, they've got to first recover
3 the costs that they invest in running the event. So
4 they've got to pay for the bulldozers and fuel and all
5 of the things they do, and then give us the rest of the
6 money. You could do that with the associations,
7 perhaps. There's a possibility that you could do that
8 like with the Hollister Hills Off-Road Association
9 could sponsor a big event, or you could have outside
10 groups come in and do that and turn all of the profits
11 back over to State Parks.

12 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: That's not really
13 going to work because the clubs that hold the events,
14 maybe it's the one event or two events that they do all
15 year long, and so that small margin that they might
16 make over the costs, that's what's supporting their
17 club and their operations itself. So there won't be
18 enough left over really for the park. But like you
19 said, maybe an association that's nonprofit that might
20 end up having something left over for the park, but
21 club-wise I would say that probably isn't going to
22 happen.

23 CHIEF JENKINS: So I think what you're saying is
24 it's possible. The private clubs might not want to do
25 that. It might not be in their best interest. The

1 associations, it's part of their mission, and they
2 might be more likely candidates for that.

3 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: I think part of what the
4 discussion is is thinking outside the box. Are there
5 types of events that we haven't held to date so you're
6 looking at those clubs who have to recover certain
7 funds, but is there an opportunity where if we begin to
8 think outside the box and start partnering with certain
9 higher-end organizations, whatever that might look
10 like, do we have an ability to do something that would
11 result in revenue coming back to the park. I think
12 that's what --

13 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Tell me if I'm running
14 on track here, for instance, something that would make
15 revenue for Hollister Hills would be is if somehow we
16 were able to hold a national Motocross there but it was
17 promoted by Hollister Hills Off-Road Association versus
18 a private promoter, therefore, all of a sudden, there
19 could potentially be a large revenue base to draw from.

20 COMMISSIONER KERR: Well, I'm glad you mentioned
21 that because I think what I'd like to suggest in the
22 interest of efficiency of the meeting is that the
23 Commission provide direction to the staff, and like to
24 me and to whoever else is interested, to potentially
25 look at holding an event at Hollister Hills to see if

1 it's feasible to generate significant income maybe.
2 And I think that you would have to look at the Hangtown
3 event to see, you know. I assume we have access to the
4 books of the Hangtown event.

5 CHIEF JENKINS: They have to show us what they
6 make so that we know what percentage they make --

7 COMMISSIONER KERR: So what I would suggest is
8 we do the following: Take the Hangtown sort of thing
9 and understand what the finances are of running an
10 event like that, investigate whether something like
11 that could get larger and potentially have a
12 significant financial contribution to Hollister Hills.
13 And then if so, at our next meeting talk about what we
14 found out, what the staff has found out, and have the
15 Commission weigh in on whether they wanted to try to do
16 something like a national Motocross or whatever. I
17 don't think the staff wants to go off and run with this
18 without having it as a formal agenda item, which is
19 today, and understanding the feeling of the Commission.

20 CHAIR LUEDER: Do we want to authorize a
21 subcommittee of Commissioner Kerr and Commissioner
22 Silverberg to help staff investigate that; would that
23 be helpful to staff?

24 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Sure, absolutely.

25 CHAIR LUEDER: Are both of you willing to serve

1 on that subcommittee?

2 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Yes.

3 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. Then I'd like to make a
4 motion that we establish an Event Subcommittee
5 consisting of Commissioner Silverberg and
6 Commissioner Kerr to work with staff on investigating a
7 future event that would benefit SVRAs or one
8 specifically, and then report back to the Commission at
9 the next meeting.

10 COMMISSIONER KERR: It's not to say you couldn't
11 do that other places. They're going to be kind of busy
12 around here from what I understand.

13 CHAIR LUEDER: Do I hear a second on that?

14 COMMISSIONER WILLARD: I'll second.

15 CHAIR LUEDER: All in favor?

16 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

17 DEPUTY DIR. GREENE: Did you want to have public
18 comment?

19 CHAIR LUEDER: Yes.

20 SUPT. KATHY DOLINAR: I just wanted to make one
21 comment. John, if you could come up. One of the ways
22 that we have done this, and it's a lot smaller scale,
23 but at the Truckhaven four-by-four area, and
24 Commissioner Lueder you have been there, we partner
25 with Tierra del Sol who comes out every year and runs

1 their event. And in exchange for them doing their
2 event, rather than charging them, we use volunteer
3 hours. And this time we partnered with them and a
4 company called W.E. Rock to put in our four-by-four
5 area. Tierra del Sol also invested funding into the
6 four-by-four area in-lieu of us charging them for their
7 special event. We're now working with W.E. Rock, who
8 is a private promoter, to put on an event in the area,
9 and we'll use the funding from that event to help
10 maintain the area as well as develop one additional
11 obstacle that everyone would like to --

12 COMMISSIONER KERR: I'd like to hear about that,
13 too, maybe staff can communicate back and forth about
14 how that worked.

15 JOHN STEWART: John Stewart with California
16 Association of 4-Wheel Drive Clubs, but also with the
17 Tierra del Sol 4-Wheel Drive Club of San Diego. I
18 would like to say that partnerships and things like
19 that are great. There's a lot of opportunity. But to
20 host an event and put on an event, there is a lot of
21 work that has to be done for the infrastructure as a
22 park itself, but there's a lot of other work that has
23 to be accomplished in order to coordinate everything
24 that comes into play.

25 When you're dealing with the clubs and the

1 associations, you have to keep in mind that a lot of
2 these are people that are volunteers that are doing
3 this in their after-hour time, and their time is
4 precious and committed personal to them. And it's very
5 easy to burn out volunteers if care is not taken in how
6 these things are approached. So if you put too much of
7 a load or requirement on the volunteers, you could kill
8 the golden goose. Thank you.

9 ED WALDHEIM: Ed Waldheim. I'm kind of taken
10 aback that you're talking about events. I wasn't
11 looking at partnership as being events driven. I was
12 looking at partnership to assisting the agencies to do
13 the work that they have to do on the ground when
14 they're short of staff. Now, the SVRAs are in a luxury
15 situation where they have staff and they have money.
16 But when you take counties and cities and the BLM and
17 Forest Service, money is the least thing that they
18 have, and they need partners to help to get things
19 done.

20 For 12 years, I've run North Fork Station in the
21 Angeles National Forest. We took over two houses and a
22 whole fire station that was going to go underground.
23 They were going to demolish it. We've been going up
24 there working in partnership with them. We work in
25 partnership with the Angeles National Forest in Rowher

1 Flats to create a rock obstacle course. We just
2 finished the one down in San Gabriel Canyon, and that
3 was money from Los Angeles County in-lieu funds. In
4 Kern County, I've done the same thing, get money from
5 the Tourism Board.

6 There are different areas where we are as a
7 nonprofit can help the agencies. But the key is, the
8 key is to get in managers, as you saw Neil working in
9 Glamis, or Kathy working Ocotillo Wells, who's willing
10 to work with the partners. So many times we find that
11 agencies think, well, it's my land, and you're welcome
12 to come and pick up a bag of trash, and thank you very
13 much, bye, go home. I'm not interested in that
14 anymore.

15 I'm interested in helping the agency preserve
16 the access to our public lands. That is where we're
17 getting killed because the federal agencies don't have
18 the time or the desire really to go out there to make
19 sure that we preserve our open riding areas, our open
20 walking areas, our open hunting areas, whatever it is
21 you do. They don't have that desire. It's not in
22 their guts. It's us, private sector, who can bring
23 that element, and the key is to somehow figure out that
24 the federal agencies will wake up and utilize us more
25 to get the things done, and we can do it.

1 I've proven that we can do it. The three
2 nonprofits, I've got close to \$5 million now in the
3 last four or five years, and that's why I invite you to
4 come to see what it is that a partnership can do when
5 you have a manager willing to work with you. I would
6 like to see us foster that more to make sure that we
7 protect our access to our public lands.

8 COMMISSIONER SLAVIK: I couldn't let this pass
9 without saying something about SBNFA. I mean Ed knows
10 and some of the people who have been here a long time
11 know, to get the federal managers and actually even
12 State Parks on board with an association was a
13 monumental task. It probably took us four to five
14 years to get State Parks to really understand the whole
15 concept and to break through that kind of level of
16 their bureaucracy and let volunteers do a lot of the
17 work that they were anticipating they were going to do
18 themselves.

19 But the SBNFA is a good example of a broad
20 spectrum of land-use activities that can be taken care
21 of by a nonprofit association. And I think that's kind
22 of the direction we're talking about, I believe, is to
23 assist the agencies to take care of the land like Ed
24 was talking about.

25 COMMISSIONER KERR: Another aspect of it.

1 CHAIR LUEDER: Okay. I think we've had a
2 discussion about it, unless anybody else has anything
3 to add, we're finished on that item.

4 So unless there is anything else, I just want to
5 thank everybody, Division staff, Ocotillo Wells staff,
6 and Heber Dunes staff, and anybody else that I missed
7 for coming down and enduring through some wind, some
8 bumpy airplane rides, and everything else. It was a
9 fun time, and I appreciate everybody's help. And so
10 with that, do I hear a motion to adjourn?

11 COMMISSIONER KERR: So moved.

12 COMMISSIONER SILVERBERG: Second.

13 CHAIR LUEDER: All in favor?

14 (Commissioners simultaneously voted.)

15 CHAIR LUEDER: We're adjourned.

16 (Meeting adjourned at 2:55 p.m.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25